

# Private Training Establishment (PTE) Case Studies

## Table of Contents

<b>1 <u>Analysis of the case studies – Private Training Establishment (PTE) Sector</u></b>	4
<b>2 <u>Case Study 1: Providing authentic ‘real work’ assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience</u></b>	6
2.1 <u>About the tertiary sector</u>	7
2.2 <u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	8
2.3 <u>Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy</u>	10
2.4 <u>Strengths and limitations</u>	11
2.5 <u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	13
<b>3 <u>Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students</u></b>	14
3.1 <u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	15
3.2 <u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	16
3.3 <u>Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy</u>	18
3.4 <u>Strengths and limitations</u>	19
3.5 <u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	21
<b>4 <u>Case Study 3: A videoed mock job interview promotes self-assessment</u></b>	22
4.1 <u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	23
4.2 <u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	24
4.3 <u>Purpose of the assessment strategy</u>	25
4.4 <u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	26
<b>5 <u>Case Study 4: An orientation trip project provides a focus for students’ learning</u></b>	27
5.1 <u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	28
5.2 <u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	29

5.3	<u>Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy</u>	30
5.4	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	31
<b>6</b>	<b><u>Case Study 5: Being assessed taking a tour is the only way to assess a tour guide</u></b>	32
6.1	<u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	33
6.2	<u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	34
6.3	<u>Purpose of the assessment strategy</u>	36
6.4	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	37
<b>7</b>	<b><u>Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors</u></b>	38
7.1	<u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	39
7.2	<u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	40
7.3	<u>Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy</u>	42
7.4	<u>Strengths and limitations</u>	43
7.5	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	44
<b>8</b>	<b><u>Case Study 7: Peer review enriches the learning</u></b>	45
8.1	<u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	46
8.2	<u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	47
8.3	<u>Motivation and purpose for adopting the assessment strategy</u>	49
8.4	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	50
<b>9</b>	<b><u>Case Study 8: Individual assessment takes place within a competitive group activity</u></b>	51
9.1	<u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	52
9.2	<u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	54
9.3	<u>Purpose of the assessment strategy</u>	55
9.4	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	56
<b>10</b>	<b><u>Case Study 9: Gathering evidence of competence from a range of sources</u></b>	57
10.1	<u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	58
10.2	<u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	59
10.3	<u>Purpose of the assessment strategy</u>	61

10.4	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	62
<b>11</b>	<b><u>Case Study 10: An assessment which promotes networking and community development</u></b>	<b>63</b>
11.1	<u>About the tertiary teacher</u>	64
11.2	<u>Description of the assessment strategy</u>	65
11.3	<u>Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy</u>	66
11.4	<u>Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy</u>	67

# 1 Analysis of the case studies - Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector

Analysis of the Case Studies from the Private Training Establishment sector from the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

## **The Private Training Establishment sector**

---

### **The tertiary teachers**

Ten staff members from seven different PTEs were interviewed. The majority were tutors and some held other roles within their organisation, including two Managers, a Resource Writer, a Head of Studies, and an Academic Services Manager.

### **Subject/Discipline**

The ten staff members discussed assessment strategies from the following eight subject areas: Travel and Tourism, Cultural Tourism, Tour Guiding, Arts and Community Development, Contemporary Christian Music, Farming, Automotive Servicing, and Child Protection Studies.

### **Class levels, sizes and student groups**

The PTE sector assessment strategies were employed in a range of qualifications including certificates, unit standards, and an undergraduate degree. The class levels included two at Levels 1 and 2; three at Level 3; four at Level 4; and one strategy spanned Levels 5 to 7.

The class sizes described by the teachers in the PTE sector were mostly smaller than those described by teachers in the previous two sectors. Overall the class sizes ranged from 10 to 30 students. Five classes consisted of 18 students, or between 18 and 20 students, two consisted of between 10 and 12 students, another two consisted of between 10 and 20/25 students and one class consisted of 30 students.

When asked to describe the students in their classes, six of the PTE teachers mentioned domestic school leavers; three mentioned mature students; three mentioned students who meet the funding criteria; one mentioned Maori and Pasifika students; and one described a diverse group of students with a wide range of previous formal learning experiences.

### **Assessment background**

When asked how they had gained knowledge of assessment practices, seven of the tertiary teachers said they had adult education qualifications at Levels 4 and 5.

Other methods of learning about assessment mentioned by the teachers included:

- Experimenting to find out what works well
- Drawing on their own individual experiences as students including being a student of music performance
- Taking leadership roles in Kapa Haka groups and a Maori Tourism business
- Participating in The Learning for Living project

## **The Assessment Strategies**

---

### The Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector Case studies

Several of the strategies from the PTE sector are notable for their use of authentic tasks that mirror 'real world' activities. Three of the strategies were described as simulation activities; two involved work based reality and one involved a mock job interview. Two other strategies were described as case study projects and a sixth strategy involved a practical demonstration within a group activity.

The other three strategies consisted of a project and oral presentation; a fact sheet and oral presentation; and an assessment that required staff to gather evidence from a wide range of sources to verify students' learning.

## 2 Case Study 1: Providing authentic 'real work' assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Jules Buri

**Organisation:** Travel Careers and Training

**E-mail:** [jules@travelcareers.co.nz](mailto:jules@travelcareers.co.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'Employers said they loved our students but that when they got into a real environment, they didn't understand how everything worked together.'**

Feedback from Industry Advisory meetings motivated the adoption of a work based reality assessment strategy. This strategy overcomes one of the biggest problems with unit standard assessment in that it requires students to integrate the knowledge and skills they have gained throughout the course in order to complete a range of real work based tasks. Working in a team, with pressure to work through a number of scenarios and complete a range of tasks means that students gain a lot of insight into their ability to apply their learning in a situation which mirrors what they will experience when they gain employment in the industry. Feedback from their tutor aids this learning.

Students are generally very positive about this strategy and think that it is fun although some students can be stressed by it.

## 2.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 1

Part 2 in **Case Study 1: Providing authentic 'real work' assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Jules Buri is a tutor and tutor trainer at Travel Careers and Training, a PTE which offers specialist training in aviation, travel and tourism. She teaches a range of subjects in National Certificate programmes at levels 3 and 4.

Jules has completed the National Certificate in Adult Teaching Level 5 and is particularly interested in the use of accelerated learning techniques.

### Views of Assessment and assessment trends

---

Jules has been teaching for just over two years and during that time sees that there has been a move in the organisation away from written assessment to using more practical, hands on, case studies and role playing activities. She thinks that with travel and tourism training, practical, hands on activities and assessments work extremely well because they offer a more 'real life' learning experience.

## 2.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 1

Part 3 in **Case Study 1: Providing authentic 'real work' assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience** a case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The strategy comes from a course within the National Certificate in Travel (Level 3). It is a formative assessment which is run at the end of the Level 3 qualification, just prior to students going out for work experience in the travel and tourism industry. It is not part of the National Certificate in Travel in that the students gain the qualification by completing the unit standards that make up the National Certificate. 'This is an additional module that we offer our students and the reason that we offer it is that the travel industry, has asked us to provide something that makes everything more realistic ... it is part of the overall course and when we explain to students that the industry has asked for this they get quite excited about it'.

The strategy requires students to bring all the learning from the unit standards they have completed into one assessment in which they apply their learning to a range of scenarios and produce certain outcomes such as bookings and itineraries.

Students are put into teams of 4-5 and over three days they participate in an exercise which mirrors a real work environment. The tutors become customers and approach the 'travel agency' or 'hotel' with travel scenarios. These scenarios will be presented to students in a variety of ways: for example fax, e-mail or walk-in 'customers'. The tutors draw from prepared scenarios of clients wanting different kinds of bookings and itineraries prepared for them.

The room is set up as a travel agency with a range of resources which would be found in a travel agency: computers, telephones, fax machines, brochures, guide books, insurance forms.

Each team has a team leader and that person can decide whether to feed out the work to individuals or have the whole team working together on one booking. The tutor monitors the group's work and if the group is obviously behind schedule, the tutor suggests various ways the group can catch up to ensure that each student meets the minimum requirements. The exercise runs all day for three days and it is usual that students work until 5pm or come in early the next morning if they need to catch up. This also contributes to making it as realistic as possible.

The tutor has a work-based reality checklist to assess that each student has completed at least three domestic air bookings incorporating flights, meal requests, car rental and hotel bookings. At least two itineraries are to be completed by each team including accommodation, sightseeing and route planning. Each student will be observed handling at least 3 objections or complaints from a 'customer' and each student has to demonstrate competence in using the equipment, telephone, fax, e-mail, photocopier, Eftpos machine



and processes such as advising on travel insurance terms and conditions, receipting payments and e-mailing suppliers.

Prior to starting the work based reality, the tutor will explain in detail to the students what will be expected and will also show work completed by students in previous work-based reality assessments such as a finished itinerary. One tutor runs the class and other tutors present the students with scenarios. The class tutor talks with each student at the end of the day and feeds back to them what s/he saw them doing well and where they could improve.

## 2.3 Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy - Case Study 1

Part 4 in **Case Study 1: Providing authentic 'real work' assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience** a case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### **Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy**

---

Feedback from the Industry Advisory Board meetings motivated the adoption of this strategy. 'They say they love our students but that when they get into a real environment, they don't understand how everything works together.'

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

To enable the students to demonstrate how they can integrate the knowledge and skills they have gained during the course in order to complete a set of 'real' work tasks.

## 2.4 Strengths and limitations - Case Study 1

Part 5 in **Case Study 1: Providing authentic 'real work' assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience** a case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Strengths and limitations

---

This assessment responds to requests from the industry. The strategy overcomes one of the biggest problems with unit standard assessment in that it requires students to integrate the knowledge and skills they have gained throughout the course in order to complete a range of real work based tasks. Working in a team, with pressure to work through a number of scenarios and complete a range of tasks means that students gain a lot of insight into their ability to apply their learning in a situation which mirrors what they will experience when they gain employment in the industry. Feedback from their tutor aids this learning.

Students have seen all the resources before and learned everything they need to know to complete the tasks; there is nothing new to surprise them. They spend some time recapping before they begin the work based reality so this reinforces their learning. However in addition to the travel related knowledge and skills, they are also practicing work related skills such as time management, prioritising tasks and team work. This assessment provides a good test of ability to prioritise work and time and stress management. 'Students can notice straight away where their strengths lie. For some students it is quite stressful when a customer (tutor) is ringing constantly asking where his quote is... . They are under quite a lot of pressure.'

In addition to the feedback from their tutor, students gain quite a lot of knowledge about themselves through this process. They gauge their own abilities and strengths and also realise where they need to improve. It also gives them a sense of confidence that they will be able to manage when out on their work experience placement.

Tutors get a lot insight into each student's progress and this enables them to give each student very specific feedback both about their strengths and weaknesses and also about where in the industry they might best be placed.

In order to create such a realistic assessment there is a lot of preparation for the tutor prior to the assessment. Although there are some pre-prepared scenarios the tutor needs to build on that base and also needs to keep the scenarios up to date.

During the work based reality, the tutor has to be constantly on the ball. They are not going to necessarily know the information that students will need. They need to be quite creative and draw on their own knowledge of the industry. 'It's a bit full on for the tutor ...they are pretty tired at the end of the 3 days but the tutor tends to enjoy it as much as the students ...it makes it real and reminds us what its like in the industry.'

There is also quite a lot of marking and because there is a range of possible answers, for example there is never only one correct answer for an itinerary, it takes a lot of time to check the students' work. Sometimes Jules shares the finished work amongst the groups so

that each group marks another group's work. This is effective in that groups can see different ideas from theirs coming through.

## 2.5 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 1

Part 6 in **Case Study 1: Providing authentic 'real work' assessment to integrate learning and prepare students for work experience** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### **Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy**

---

#### **Response from students**

---

Students get the chance to debrief at the end of the work based reality and they comment on what worked well and what didn't. They are generally very positive and think that it has been fun although some students are quite stressed by it.

#### **Response from colleagues**

---

Because all the tutors in TCT use this strategy, they always let each other know what worked well and what didn't when they complete the work based reality for their class.

#### **Dissemination**

---

The tutor trainer shares this strategy amongst tutors across the Company. But it has not been shared outside the Company.

### 3 Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

#### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Elsbeth Bloem

**Organisation:** Aviation & Travel Training Group

**Email:** [Elsbethbloem@sirgeorge.ac.nz](mailto:Elsbethbloem@sirgeorge.ac.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'In this assessment, students need to work independently and think about what they have learnt in class and how they are actually going to apply it to a case study... they get a feel for what the real world is like.'**

Wanting to give students a practical experience of how their learning might come together in a 'real' task motivated this assessment strategy. Prior to the development of this assessment, two written assessments were used. Students were complaining about 'writer's cramp' because they had to do so much writing and it made me think - that's not real life. They would not have to hand write itineraries, hand write invoices... it was not real ...so I thought how could I make it more real'.

This assessment strategy now involves 6 tasks based around a case study. Students are given a 'client' who is organizing a family reunion with a group of 10 in the South Island. The student takes on the role of a travel consultant and works through the process of selling and processing this travel request. The tutor takes the role of the client and the wholesaler and at times makes the process difficult for the student who has to go and back forth between the client and the wholesaler until all the arrangements are finalized.

The students love this assessment because they feel they are combining lots of skills and that they are really learning something relevant.

## 3.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 2

Part 2 in **Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Jules Buri is a tutor and tutor trainer at Travel Careers and Training, a PTE which offers specialist training in aviation, travel and tourism. She teaches a range of subjects in National Certificate programmes at levels 3 and 4.

Jules has completed the National Certificate in Adult Teaching Level 5 and is particularly interested in the use of accelerated learning techniques.

### Views of Assessment and assessment trends

---

Jules has been teaching for just over two years and during that time sees that there has been a move in the organisation away from written assessment to using more practical, hands on, case studies and role playing activities. She thinks that with travel and tourism training, practical, hands on activities and assessments work extremely well because they offer a more 'real life' learning experience.

## 3.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 2

Part 3 in **Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The strategy comes from a course within the National Certificate in Travel (Level 3). It is a formative assessment which is run at the end of the Level 3 qualification, just prior to students going out for work experience in the travel and tourism industry. It is not part of the National Certificate in Travel in that the students gain the qualification by completing the unit standards that make up the National Certificate. 'This is an additional module that we offer our students and the reason that we offer it is that the travel industry, has asked us to provide something that makes everything more realistic ... it is part of the overall course and when we explain to students that the industry has asked for this they get quite excited about it'.

The strategy requires students to bring all the learning from the unit standards they have completed into one assessment in which they apply their learning to a range of scenarios and produce certain outcomes such as bookings and itineraries.

Students are put into teams of 4-5 and over three days they participate in an exercise which mirrors a real work environment. The tutors become customers and approach the 'travel agency' or 'hotel' with travel scenarios. These scenarios will be presented to students in a variety of ways: for example fax, e-mail or walk-in 'customers'. The tutors draw from prepared scenarios of clients wanting different kinds of bookings and itineraries prepared for them.

The room is set up as a travel agency with a range of resources which would be found in a travel agency: computers, telephones, fax machines, brochures, guide books, insurance forms.

Each team has a team leader and that person can decide whether to feed out the work to individuals or have the whole team working together on one booking. The tutor monitors the group's work and if the group is obviously behind schedule, the tutor suggests various ways the group can catch up to ensure that each student meets the minimum requirements. The exercise runs all day for three days and it is usual that students work until 5pm or come in early the next morning if they need to catch up. This also contributes to making it as realistic as possible.

The tutor has a work-based reality checklist to assess that each student has completed at least three domestic air bookings incorporating flights, meal requests, car rental and hotel bookings. At least two itineraries are to be completed by each team including accommodation, sightseeing and route planning. Each student will be observed handling at least 3 objections or complaints from a 'customer' and each student has to demonstrate competence in using the equipment, telephone, fax, e-mail, photocopier, Eftpos machine



and processes such as advising on travel insurance terms and conditions, receipting payments and e-mailing suppliers.

Prior to starting the work based reality, the tutor will explain in detail to the students what will be expected and will also show work completed by students in previous work-based reality assessments such as a finished itinerary. One tutor runs the class and other tutors present the students with scenarios. The class tutor talks with each student at the end of the day and feeds back to them what s/he saw them doing well and where they could improve.

## 3.3 Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy - Case Study 2 Unpublished

Part 4 in **Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### **Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy**

---

Feedback from the Industry Advisory Board meetings motivated the adoption of this strategy. 'They say they love our students but that when they get into a real environment, they don't understand how everything works together.'

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

To enable the students to demonstrate how they can integrate the knowledge and skills they have gained during the course in order to complete a set of 'real' work tasks.

## 3.4 Strengths and limitations - Case Study 2

Unpublished

Part 5 in **Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Strengths and limitations

---

This assessment responds to requests from the industry. The strategy overcomes one of the biggest problems with unit standard assessment in that it requires students to integrate the knowledge and skills they have gained throughout the course in order to complete a range of real work based tasks. Working in a team, with pressure to work through a number of scenarios and complete a range of tasks means that students gain a lot of insight into their ability to apply their learning in a situation which mirrors what they will experience when they gain employment in the industry. Feedback from their tutor aids this learning.

Students have seen all the resources before and learned everything they need to know to complete the tasks; there is nothing new to surprise them. They spend some time recapping before they begin the work based reality so this reinforces their learning. However in addition to the travel related knowledge and skills, they are also practicing work related skills such as time management, prioritising tasks and team work. This assessment provides a good test of ability to prioritise work and time and stress management. 'Students can notice straight away where their strengths lie. For some students it is quite stressful when a customer (tutor) is ringing constantly asking where his quote is.... They are under quite a lot of pressure.'

In addition to the feedback from their tutor, students gain quite a lot of knowledge about themselves through this process. They gauge their own abilities and strengths and also realise where they need to improve. It also gives them a sense of confidence that they will be able to manage when out on their work experience placement.

Tutors get a lot insight into each student's progress and this enables them to give each student very specific feedback both about their strengths and weaknesses and also about where in the industry they might best be placed.

In order to create such a realistic assessment there is a lot of preparation for the tutor prior to the assessment. Although there are some pre-prepared scenarios the tutor needs to build on that base and also needs to keep the scenarios up to date.

During the work based reality, the tutor has to be constantly on the ball. They are not going to necessarily know the information that students will need. They need to be quite creative and draw on their own knowledge of the industry. 'It's a bit full on for the tutor .. they are pretty tired at the end of the 3 days but the tutor tends to enjoy it as much as the students .. it makes it real and reminds us what its like in the industry.'

There is also quite a lot of marking and because there is a range of possible answers, for example there is never only one correct answer for an itinerary, it takes a lot of time to check the students' work. Sometimes Jules shares the finished work amongst the groups so

that each group marks another group's work. This is effective in that groups can see different ideas from theirs coming through.

## 3.5 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 2 Unpublished

Part 6 in **Case Study 2: Application of learning to a case study provides a reality check for students** a case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### **Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy**

---

#### **Response from students**

---

Students get the chance to debrief at the end of the work based reality and they comment on what worked well and what didn't. They are generally very positive and think that it has been fun although some students are quite stressed by it.

#### **Response from colleagues**

---

Because all the tutors in TCT use this strategy, they always let each other know what worked well and what didn't when they complete the work based reality for their class.

#### **Dissemination**

---

The tutor trainer shares this strategy amongst tutors across the Company. But it has not been shared outside the Company.

## 4 Case Study 3: A videoed mock job interview promotes self-assessment

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Kylie Wilson

**Organisation:** Travel Careers & Training

**Email:** [kylie@travelcareers.co.nz](mailto:kylie@travelcareers.co.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'This is a particularly powerful strategy because students are watching themselves (on the video) and learning from what they can see...they pick things up in this mock situation before they go to a real job interview'.**

Students who take courses at Travel Careers & Training (TCT) are prepared for employment in the travel and tourism industry. The success of the courses is measured by the number of graduates who gain employment. Staff support students to achieve this goal in a range of ways and one of them is to assist them to do well at job interviews. Students take part in a mock job interview which is videoed so that they can see themselves in the situation and analyse their strengths and weaknesses. Opportunities for improvement are immediately obvious to the students.

Students believe that they are getting a helping hand through this assessment. With some of the courses they do, they cannot see immediately how it is going to help them but with this course they can see an instant benefit.

## 4.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 3

Part 2 in **Case Study 3: A videoed mock job interview promotes self-assessment.** A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Kylie Wilson comes from a background of being a travel agent and a tutor of travel and tourism before becoming the Wellington Campus Manager for Travel Careers and Training.

Kylie has completed the National Certificate in Adult Teaching Level 4. She is particularly interested in the ways in which we prepare students for work in the industry.

### Views of Assessment and assessment trends

---

Kylie thinks a range of assessment strategies should be used from closed and open book tests to oral and role play assessments. The important thing is that the assessment is in line with the learning and allows students to demonstrate the knowledge and skills required of them and gain feedback. At Travel Careers and Training, students complete National Certificates in Travel and Tourism Levels 3 & 4 so they must be assessed against the unit standards however a range of other formative assessment is also included in the programme.

## 4.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 3

Part 3 in **Case Study 3: A videoed mock job interview promotes self-assessment**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### **Description of the Assessment Strategy**

---

In this assessment, students studying travel and tourism at Level 3 take part in a mock job interview which is videoed so that students can see themselves and analyse their strengths and weaknesses. The assessment strategy is over and above what is required for students to complete the National Certificate but it is included in the course to prepare students for job interviews. It is a formative assessment which is taken very seriously by tutors and students.

Students are prepared for the assessment by being given lots of coaching prior to the interview but when they enter the interview room, everything is treated as if it was an actual job interview. Students are given their interview time and they must come dressed as they would for a real interview. The job they are being interviewed for has either been given to them by the tutor, as it is the kind of job they would be likely to apply for at the end of the course, or it may be an actual job. The tutor may have taken their class onto the Seek website the day before and asked them to find a job they want to apply for right now - 'so it may be a job in a retail clothing store or a night porter job at a hotel which they can do part time while studying'. Students are then asked to research the particular company so that they come prepared for their interview. The interview is videoed for approximately 10-15 minutes.

Students have the chance to watch the video during their mid-course meeting with the Head of Studies. After watching the video, the student is asked to self assess his/her performance. The Head of Studies has a checklist and will ask the student a range of questions: 'how well do you think you were groomed for this interview? What did you notice about your body language? How well do you think you answered that question? If you were to answer that question again, how do you think you would answer it now?' Once the student has had the chance to assess herself, the Head of Studies gives feedback. 'We would obviously try to pull out a few things they did really well to encourage them and a few things they could improve on.'

### **Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy**

---

This is an additional assessment which students do not need to pass to complete their National Certificate but do need to complete to receive their TCT Certificate. It was introduced because employers in the travel industry said they were looking for applicants who were well groomed and presented and interviewed well. The need to gain good employment outcomes to ensure continuation of Government funding led to the recognition of importance of preparing students for employment interviews.



## 4.3 Purpose of the assessment strategy - Case Study 3

Part 4 in **Case Study 3: A videoed mock job interview promotes self-assessment.** A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

The explicit aim of courses run by TCT is to prepare students in a holistic way to gain employment in the Travel and Tourism industry. This assessment contributes to this aim.

### **Strengths and limitations**

---

Because students and tutors prepare for the mock interview to make it as realistic as possible, it becomes as close as possible to the actual experience of being interviewed for a job. Students feel nervous as they would in the real situation. This experiential learning makes it a very successful strategy.

In addition, the videoing of the interview gives the student opportunities to self-assess in quite a structured way. Prior to this 'students get a lot of feedback with every assessment they do and they are asked for their input ...but some of them are pretty shy'. However watching a video of yourself does promote self-assessment in that students quickly pick up behaviour that they didn't realize they did. For example one student said 'I'm staring at the interviewer with open eyes trying to make good eye contact but, you know, it looked a bit daunting'.

This assessment is sequenced before students go out on work experience so it helps them prepare for that.

It appears to work well with a diverse group of students. Some of the international students seem to enjoy the formal nature of the interview. For Maori and Pasifika students, who 'don't like to talk themselves up or make themselves sound great', the coaching is very beneficial. 'We coach them to pull out specific examples of things they have done and that story will tell the employer how good they are.'

It is not possible to video an entire interview so it is usually 'a snapshot' of about 10-15 minutes. It takes a bit of preparation by tutors who need to set up the video recorder and prepare for the specific job that the student is interested in. Interviewing 18 students in one day makes it an intensive day for the tutor. Apart from some immediate feedback after the interview, the tutor is not required to give further assessment as this is done later by the Head of Studies during the mid-course meeting with the student.

## 4.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 3

Part 5 in **Case Study 3: A videoed mock job interview promotes self-assessment.** A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

Students want to do this assessment because they all want a job and they think it is going to help them. Many students give a lot of feedback once they have actually been for an interview. 'They come back and say - they asked me about my strengths and weaknesses and I was able to answer because we had practiced it'. They also bring back interesting questions and the staff quiz them to make sure that they are still in line with what's happening in job interviews.

#### Response from colleagues

---

The tutors all really value this assessment because they see what a valuable tool it is for students.

#### Dissemination

---

The idea of giving students the opportunity to practice a job interview is probably quite widely used. However the videoing of the interview and the structured self-assessment and feedback may be of interest to others. However this strategy has not been shared outside the Company.

## 5 Case Study 4: An orientation trip project provides a focus for students' learning

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Brenda Rawiri

**Organisation:** Sir George Seymour National College of Airline, Travel & Tourism

**Email:** [Brenda@sirgeorge.ac.nz](mailto:Brenda@sirgeorge.ac.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'I use the orientation trip project to enable students to see people in action, to see what they might want to get into so they can assess where their focus is going to be for the rest of the year and in that way they have a goal.'**

Previously students had completed the unit standards that make up the cultural tourism programme without seeing how they might apply the learning in a job. The purpose of this strategy is to help students analyse what areas of cultural tourism interest them so that they can focus on the course and make the most of it. At the same time the teacher 'can analyse their interests with them in order to tailor the course so students meet their goals'.

While visiting a number of Maori tourism ventures in Rotorua, students assess them from the point of view of being a visitor. They then bring this information together into an oral presentation. In the presentation they deliver their analysis of the particular venture, what stood out for them, what could have been improved upon and what they learnt through this experience of being a tourist. Students are usually shy about doing a presentation but they do see the benefit of it because 'no matter what you are doing in cultural tourism you will need to be able to get up and speak to people'.

## 5.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 4

Part 2 in **Case Study 4: An orientation trip project provides a focus for students' learning** a case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Brenda Rawiri tutors on the Certificate in Cultural Tourism at the Auckland Campus of Sir George Seymour College. She is responsible for the level 3 Tourism Maori unit standards that are included in the course. Students complete the National Certificate in Tourism Maori (L3) qualification as part of their course. Brenda was selected to teach the course because she is from the area, has 20 years' experience in cultural tourism and has good contacts. Because she is the only tutor at the campus that can teach the course, she has a lot of control over the teaching and learning strategies that are used. She has done quite a lot of 'experimenting' and found that 'more practical application meant more understanding for myself and I hoped for the students'.

Brenda developed her knowledge of teaching and learning through her role as a leader in kapa haka and at a Maori tourism business where part of her role was to teach school groups. Through kapa haka she learnt a process of introducing learners to a new concept, allowing them to see it in action and experience it and then apply it. She has brought this process into her teaching and assessment at Sir George. She has also been a university student which has helped her analyse what kind of assessment works well for her.

### Views of assessment

---

When she began teaching on this course, Brenda found that some of the assessments in the course were 'very theoretical such as an essay and were not right for the learning the students had done'. In addition, with unit standard assessment she thinks there is a tendency to 'do a particular area and then stop and go on to the next one'. She does not agree with this because she believes that the learning and assessment in each unit standard needs to be an ongoing process woven throughout the course.

She explains that she 'uses a progression process' where she introduces the concepts, then the students go and see the concepts being put into action and then they might put the concepts into action themselves before being assessed on them. For example with the unit standard which requires students to use Maori greetings and farewells in a hosting context, Brenda's students might be introduced to the concept of powhiri by being welcomed onto a Marae when they start and again on their orientation trip. Later they will assist with hosting a marae visit for the rest of students on campus. While the students are doing this, Brenda assesses them formatively and gives them feedback on what they did well and the areas they needed to work further on. They then complete the summative assessment. Throughout the course, students are continuing to revisit the key concepts.

## 5.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 4

Part 3 in **Case Study 4: An orientation trip project provides a focus for students' learning**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The orientation trip project is a formative assessment which enables students to see in action a number of the concepts within the level 3 Maori Tourism unit standards that they have been working towards. Its benefit is that students see Maori customs being put into practice in a Maori tourism context; assess the tourism ventures from a visitor's perspective, while also assessing their own particular interests and goals. They then present their analysis orally so as to develop their 'public speaking skills'. Brenda finds that this assessment helps students to think about what excites them about Maori tourism and gives them a focus for their studies. Prior to this assessment students have been, for example exploring the concept of 'whanau'. During the orientation project students see this concept of bringing people together, 'whakawhanaungatanga', in action so that they 'understand more of what it means and how to apply it'. They also find that there are differing ways of putting this concept into practice and they can analyse what works best for them.

During the process of the orientation trip, students also assess where their focus might be during the course. Many of them come to the course with a narrow view of cultural tourism, 'they believe that cultural tourism is haka or poi'. Brenda wants them to understand the scope of the field. As well as music and dance, there are a number of other kinds of activities which students experience during the trip. One of the major ones is Maori tourism ventures based around 'a whanau using their own home land to earn an income for their family, to bring people to their land and to share their home with them'. The trip is an 'eye-opener' and builds a broad picture for students of what is available and what is possible. During the experience, the students assess their interests which gives them a focus during the rest of the course - a goal and a plan of working towards it. It also enables Brenda to tailor the course to meet the students' needs.

For the project, students assess each of the businesses from the point of view of a visitor. They also find out about the background, the vision, the mission statement, the marketing and the development of the business. This helps them see the flow from the idea at the beginning to what it has become. When they get back, they spend a week bringing the information together and analysing what they liked and didn't like, what they thought would have improved their experience. They develop and deliver a group presentation based on this analysis.

## 5.3 Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy - Case Study 4

Part 4 in **Case Study 4: An orientation trip project provides a focus for students' learning**. A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### **Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy**

---

The development of this strategy was motivated by two main things. One was a concern that students were being assessed in ways that were not aligned to the set of skills that they would need to work in this field. Most of the summative assessment was written short answer tests or essay assignments. The assessments neither developed students oral/public speaking skills which are vital for people working in this field nor encouraged students to apply their learning in a practical way. The consequence of this was that many students dropped out of the course before finishing or they reached the end having completed the unit standards but having no idea what they could do with the learning.

Secondly the strategy was motivated by current tertiary education policy. As funding becomes more closely linked to course completion and employment outcomes, this strategy will enable more of the students to reach these outcomes.

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

The applied, practical nature of this assessment serves multiple purposes. Students practice their speaking skills, they learn about and experience a range of tourism ventures from a tourist perspective and analyse what worked well for them. They then assess their interests, develop a career plan and focus on the learning they will need to reach their goals.

### **Strengths and limitations**

---

The self assessment provides a focus for learning.

In the assessment, students are practising the skills they will need to be successful working in this field. For many of the students the Maori customs 'are used everyday and if they can understand why they do what they do, they are better able to explain this to visitors'. The strategy would work best with small classes. This provides the opportunity for the teacher to get to know each of the student's goals and tailor the programme to meet these. Arranging practical activities and visits is always a time consuming task for the teacher.

## 5.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 4

Part 5 in **Case Study 4: An orientation trip project provides a focus for students' learning**. A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

At the beginning, 'they're not too happy about speaking in front of the group but they see the improvements they make'. They also come to realise how important speaking skills are for them if they are to gain employment in many of the cultural tourism jobs.

#### Dissemination

---

This strategy is shared with the Maori Tourism businesses who take part in providing the opportunity for students during the orientation visit. They are interviewed by students and as a result many of them think 'these students are really focused ... that they will be really good employees'. In this way the assessment 'shows off the students' to the industry and increases the students' networks.

## 6 Case Study 5: Being assessed taking a tour is the only way to assess a tour guide

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Jenny Love

**Organisation:** Sir George Seymour National College of Airline, Travel & Tourism

**Email:** [JennyLove@sirgeorge.ac.nz](mailto:JennyLove@sirgeorge.ac.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'If you want to be a tour guide, it's all about stepping out of your comfort zone and doing it.'**

Industry insisted that there needed to be a large practical aspect to this course which would take place outside a classroom. The industry thought that the assessment experiences should give students a real feel for guiding and thus allow them to determine if it is the right job for them.

In this assessment, students take a group around a tourist attraction. After the tour, the group completes an evaluation form. The tutor collates his/her own evaluation with the groups' feedback and gives each of the students feedback on their performance.

Students are generally very scared initially about this assessment however their confidence is built up through lots of practice and formative feedback from their peers and tutor. By the end, they have learned a lot about themselves and begun to develop their own tour guiding style.



## 6.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 5

Part 2 in **Case Study 5: Being assessed taking a tour is the only way to assess a tour guide.** A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Jenny is the Head of Studies at the Hamilton Campus of Sir George Seymour College. She has had a varied background in the travel and tourism industry from owning her own tour guiding business in Australia to managing a visitor information centre. She gained her travel and tourism qualifications at an Institute of Technology. She has been teaching for the last six and a half years.

### Views of assessment

---

Jenny is particularly interested in assessments that require the practical application of knowledge. She sees this as important when people are being trained for a specific industry like travel and tourism. When she was a student of travel and tourism, it was entirely a pass or fail assessment system and most of the assessments were closed book examinations. 'When I completed my study, I realised a lot of the knowledge was in my short term memory and it disappeared!'

### Assessment Trends

---

Jenny sees the competency based assessment system as a 'double edged sword'. Where students can apply their learning and go over it, it has definitely helped them to retain a lot more. On the other hand, Jenny thinks it may be too easy when students get the chance to try again and again until they have got it right. 'You have to question whether a student has a really good understanding of what they have learnt or whether they have just done it some many times that they know what they have to do for the sake of the assessment.'

## 6.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 5

Part 3 in **Case Study 5: Being assessed taking a tour is the only way to assess a tour guide.** A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The strategy described here is the summative assessment for unit standard 18314 'Prepare and deliver guided interpretation within an attraction and gather feedback' which is part of a course Certificate in Tourism Operations and Guiding. In Hamilton, the attraction that is used for the assessment is the Hamilton Zoo. Students build up to the assessment through a set of carefully designed steps. The first step is to be a participant on a tour of the zoo with a professional guide. Students take notes and sometimes they take a tape recorder so that they can listen to the commentary again later. They then learn about the theoretical aspects of taking a tour: voice, language, commentary, body language, group management, health and safety. Students do role play activities in the classroom to practice in each of these areas so a lot of feedback is gathered throughout the process. They get the chance to go back to the zoo at least twice to practice the section of the commentary that they will do for their assessment. A video camera is often used at this stage so that they can view themselves which is a very good way to notice things about their performance. As well as this self assessment, students receive feedback from their peers and tutor. Finally they have to put all the things together and take a group of six people, generally unknown to them, on a tour of the zoo. Each student covers a section of the zoo and participants complete a feedback survey on them. Participants are asked to give feedback in areas such as: the guide was pleasant and friendly, the commentary was clear and informative, the guide was able to manage the group in a professional manner. At the same time, the tutor and often the zoo staff guides complete a checklist. The tutor compiles all the feedback into a summary sheet. Jenny has found that there is usually a lot of consistency in the feedback... 'so it is not that difficult for the tutor to come to a conclusion about whether the student is either competent or not competent in each of the areas'. Later the tutor meets with the students individually and gives them feedback on their performance. When a student is not competent in an area, s/he will be given another opportunity. It is sometimes quite difficult to reassess if there are areas in which the student is not competent. For example if the weakness was in the area of group management, it would be hard to get the entire group together again to reassess the student in this area. If that was the case, the student would usually be asked to run a different type of activity, possibly with their classmates. However as this is the first of a range of practical assessments, the next one being to prepare and deliver a guided excursion, students are able to identify the areas in which they need to improve and work on them for the next assessment. The learning is scaffolded through the assessment in that the learning from one assessment is taken into the next learning and assessment task

### Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy

---

'Putting knowledge into practice and being assessed in this way is critical for being able to go out and work in that field'. When the Tour Guiding course was developed, there was a lot of input from the industry. They insisted that there needed to be a large practical aspect to this course. They didn't want the course to be classroom based. The industry also appreciates the fact that the assessment experiences give students a real feel for it and thus separate the ones who think 'my goodness this is exactly what I want to do' from the ones who are not so sure it is the right job for them.

## 6.3 Purpose of the assessment strategy - Case Study 5

Part 4 in **Case Study 5: Being assessed taking a tour is the only way to assess a tour guide.**  
A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

To provide an authentic, 'real life' assessment in which students apply the skills they have learnt in the course and take a tour of an attraction.

### **Strengths and limitations**

---

'You could say to students: "go and visit the zoo, write a commentary and come back and deliver it in the classroom", but you would lose the authenticity of the task'. One of the strengths of this assessment is that it is 'real' and made even more so by the fact that there is a group of people unknown to the student who 'take the tour' and give feedback. Often the tour guides from the attraction also give feedback which adds to the variety and quality of the feedback.

During the learning, students gain lots of formative feedback as well - self and peer assessment is a useful tool. 'There are lots of opportunities for feedback, prior to assessment, during assessment and after assessment'.

Another strength is the way that the learning from this assessment is taken into the next learning and assessment task. Students keep on developing and improving their skills.

The size of the group (5-15) makes this type of assessment possible. With classes of more than 15 students, it would become quite difficult to manage. Each student takes a section of the zoo rather than the whole tour but it's important that they get at least 20 minutes of tour guiding.

Finding at least 6 people for the tour group can be difficult. 'Sometimes we find an ex-tutor who has had a baby and ask them to come along with the baby in the pram'. This makes group management more challenging for the student. Sometimes we ask students to advertise it amongst their family and friends as well but that is not as good as the feedback can be 'coloured by that'.

It is also difficult to reassess in areas where the student is not competent as discussed above. Moderation can also be difficult. It is hard to ensure comparability of standards across the five Sir George campuses. 'It generally comes down to how helpful the notes are that tutors have written on the student's feedback summary'.

## 6.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 5

Part 5 in **Case Study 5: Being assessed taking a tour is the only way to assess a tour guide.**  
A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

Students' feedback is very favourable. 'They are very scared initially to get involved but by the time they have done the assessment and received the feedback, they have really amazed themselves and want to carry on and see how much more they can do...they learn about themselves as people'.

#### Response from colleagues

---

The tutors really enjoy seeing the students develop their own style during the assessment. While there are clear guidelines that students must follow, 'they don't have to fit into a particular box'. It is exciting for tutors to see students' development and their personality coming through.

#### Dissemination

---

Feedback from employers is also very positive. Some employers have said they would like their own employees to go through this course. They really notice the difference when people have been trained in the field.

## 7 Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Sylvie Bolstad

**Organisation:** Artmakers Trust

**Email:** [artmakers@paradise.net.nz](mailto:artmakers@paradise.net.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'This assessment strategy encourages students, through the use of self-assessment, questioning and feedback to notice things about their learning and development of work and life transferable skills.'**

When designing a curriculum in the arts for a Ministry for Youth Development training programme, Sylvie researched components from other curriculum and 'cobbled them together' and added other things to suit the particular group of learners she was working with. She found that unit standards were very discrete and small and so prescriptive that they tended to constrain the learning of her students. Instead she devised a dynamic/flexible assessment strategy which combines self and peer assessment, progress interviews and brings all the work together in a portfolio. Interpersonal and team accountability are greatly emphasised in the programme.

Students participate in a number of community projects which provide a rich source of work experience and feedback from the project sponsors, a cross section of services and agencies in the community whose interests are in education, community or social development. By the end, students can credit their learning towards the National Certificate in Community Recreation.

One of the things Sylvie finds most satisfying is when students say at the end 'I learnt heaps from you guys (the tutors) but I learnt so much from the other guys on the programme (fellow students). Self and peer assessment becomes valued by the students.

## 7.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 6

Part 2 in **Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors.**  
A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Sylvie Bolstad is the Founder and Director of the Artmakers Trust. She developed the youth programme for people aged 16-24 and it has been run at Artmakers since 1998. She is responsible for the development of the programme and the design of the assessment strategy.

### Views of Assessment and assessment trends

---

Sylvie believes that assessment should be invisible to the learner and by that she means that students' learning should not be constrained by assessment but rather that they should work through the programme, gaining lots of formative feedback and at the end when the summative assessment takes place, it is a matter of 'checking that everything has happened ... it is a way of authentically recording successes without having left anything out'. She has arrived at this view over a long period of time during which she has explored a lot of models of teaching and learning and has been inspired especially by those from community/social services and Maori contexts. She is concerned that the more regimented learning becomes, the more creativity is lost.

Sylvie has worked to encourage people to realise that there is lots of (informal) learning going on outside the classroom and in work contexts. When this was finally recognized and picked up in education policy, 'it came back as unit standards'. Sylvie saw these as too prescriptive and in respect of the arts skills, geared more towards producing curriculum driven portfolios without much transferability either in the subject material, context or processes used. In the programme offered by Artmakers, Sylvie has found a way of 'aggregating the bits together' during the delivery of the programme while still being able to disaggregate and assess them at the end.

## 7.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 6

Part 3 in **Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors.** A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The assessment strategy begins on day one of the course, when the student takes part in a self-assessment. This takes the form of an interview with one or two staff members during which the student is asked a range of investigatory questions which help them to describe their strengths, expectations and interests. This gives the staff a 'sense of where people are starting from ... and creates a kind of baseline'.

The students then begin a 20 week programme which has a structure, a sequence and a schedule but which also allows them to work at different levels according to where they may be more or less competent and where they want to go. The first three weeks is about 'building a working environment and an environment of trust and reflecting on the habits the student brought in with them - both good and bad'.

After three weeks, another self-assessment takes place. Students reflect on how they have performed over the last three weeks, how they have kept up with the schedule, how they are managing their time. This is often a reality check and helps clarify learning goals.

This self-assessment process takes place again at about week nine and this is also the point where the programme is building to a peak as the students prepare to run a children's school holiday programme. In the week prior to the commencement of the children's programme, students 'assess themselves' in terms of their team work, practical skills, planning skills, time management, ability to control their feelings and understanding of safety, health and hygiene issues. They will also assess each other and the group as a whole in terms of readiness to deliver the programme as a team.

At the mid-point of the programme after the children's programme has been completed, there is a mid-point progress interview which involves self-assessment and feedback and programme evaluation. Students consider where they were at the beginning, how far they have come and which areas they have developed in. As much as they assess their own performance they also reflect on what the programme has offered them. This progress interview forms the basis of a mid-point summary. After this they go back into another learning cycle.

In the second half of the programme, students usually complete a significant project for a community organization. For this project, they work in groups to deliver a product of some kind which might be a piece of visual art such as a mural or might be an event or festival. This gives opportunity for them to gain feedback from the community group and this is combined with peer assessment from their team. The staff also gives feedback on the product itself which is held up to scrutiny in terms of its technical qualities and attainment of certain standards.



Throughout the programme, students are compiling a portfolio of their studio projects. This is evaluated against a checklist of what needs to be included in the portfolio. Examples of drawings, logos, character animation, paintings, digital storytelling, designs and research notes are required. All the teaching staff gets together to mark the portfolio and check for validity and consistency. This portfolio is often used by the students to meet entry requirements into programmes at other tertiary education institutions.

In addition, each student receives a Summary Report which includes the feedback from the whole tutor team and comments on participation in community projects, work and study habits and workplace skills.

## 7.3 Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy - Case Study 6

Part 4 in **Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors.** A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### **Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy**

---

Sylvie wanted to structure a learning experience utilising the arts and community development in which assessment did not drive the learning. 'There should not be a tick list in front of us while we are doing the learning'. In addition she was changing the dynamic where 'assessment is done to learners'. She believes that assessment should be a fair and accurate record of what took place and allow people to identify where they have succeeded. By devising this assessment strategy, Sylvie has now aligned the assessment with the learning.

Formative assessment is threaded through the programme using self and peer assessment processes and progress interviews. The summative assessment strategy is somewhat like recognition of prior learning in that the portfolio enables the student and the tutor to see the leaning that has taken place. 'You are able to determine that these things have taken place but from different places in the programme ... so over the programme all the standards are addressed but not always in little discrete events'.

A new framework for funding from the Ministry for Youth Development requires demonstration of a set of measurable outputs in four areas of classification: transferable skills, personal development, relationship development and contribution to the community environment. This requirement will impact on the ongoing development of the programme. 'Although the four areas named are good for describing the broad divisions of the programme's aims, it is difficult to separate them into discreet and individually measurable outputs. All four are woven into most of the activities within the programme, and while they may be weighted in slightly differing proportions, they are rarely limited to fewer than three in fairly equal measure.

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

To provide a holistic learning experience in which students learn to self-assess and give peer assessment in order to gain confidence and realise that they can be self-directing in their learning.

## 7.4 Strengths and limitations - Case Study 6

Part 5 in **Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors.**  
A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Strengths and limitations

---

This is a complex assessment strategy which includes a number of assessment elements all closely woven into a comprehensive whole. The strategy effectively contributes to the programme's aims and delivery in that students many of whom have been unsuccessful or disenchanted with school, are enabled to utilise creative expression and feedback as a vehicle to gain confidence and work and life skills.

It works in an environment where there is the 'luxury of time'. Students who are together all day for 20 + weeks have time to build relationships with their tutor and their fellow students and feedback flourishes in the intensive interaction that happens over a relatively long period of time.

Unlike unit standard assessment where any learning that takes place outside the performance criteria or elements of the unit standards is neither recorded nor acknowledged, this assessment strategy encourages students, through the use of self assessment, questioning and feedback to notice things about their learning and development of work and life transferable skills,

This strategy is most suited to foundation learning and would not work well in large classes where students come together for short periods each week. It requires a lot of interaction between tutors and students and between students in groups and teams.

## 7.5 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 6

Part 6 in **Case Study 6: An assessment partnership between the learners and the assessors.**  
A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

One of the aspects that Sylvie finds most satisfying is when students say at the end 'I learnt heaps from you guys (the tutors) but I learnt so much from the other guys on the programme (fellow students). Peer assessment and lots of team work means that students form close relationships with fellow students and they learn a lot from each other. For many of the students, the greatest revelation is that they can actually contribute to their own learning.

#### Dissemination

---

Artmakers has formed close relationships with the community who provide projects for students to work on. This is a win-win scenario in that the community group gains a 'product' that they wanted and they really value watching the young people grow in confidence and skills through their involvement in the project.

## 8 Case Study 7: Peer review enriches the learning in a musical performance workshop

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Andrew Buchanan-Smart, Head of Music

**Organisation:** Vision College, ATC

**Email:** [Andrew.B@visioncollege.ac.nz](mailto:Andrew.B@visioncollege.ac.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'From the performers' point of view they learn to accept constructive critique and from the audience's (peers) point of view they are learning to listen with a critical ear and to listen to music as a musician.'**

Most performers today perform in front of audiences so in this assessment, Andrew creates an audience of students from the three years of the degree to make it as close to real life as possible. This gives the student the opportunity to get used to performing in front of lots of people as opposed to a single examiner and it is effective in helping students to grow as performing musicians.

One of the key features of this performance workshop assessment is the peer review that takes place. Not only does this help the performer to accept and learn from audience critique, it also encourages the other students to review musical performances from a range of genres and take this learning into their own performance.

In the first year, students say they feel a bit daunted by the process and concerned at the nature of the comments they might receive. After they have been through the process a few times and they find that the comments are not personal, they realise the value of both the performance and the peer review aspects of the process.

## 8.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 7

Part 2 in **Case Study 7: Peer review enriches the learning in a musical performance workshop**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Andrew Buchanan-Smart is Head of the Music School at Vision College where a degree, the Bachelor of Contemporary Christian Music, which is the first of its type in New Zealand, is delivered in Hamilton. The degree is a three year programme but Andrew designed it with exit points so that after the first year students receive the Associate of Contemporary Christian Music which is a level 5 diploma. After the second year they may leave with the level 6 diploma, the Licentiate of Contemporary Christian Music. Much of the learning Andrew has done about assessment has been through experience. As a student of the Royal Academy of Music and with Masters degrees in Music and Management, he has experienced a wide range of assessment strategies from a student's perspective. The performance workshop assessment draws together a collection of these strategies.

### Views of assessment and assessment trends

---

Andrew believes that 'the challenge about assessment is it actually must line up with what is being taught ...if it isn't aligned, the assessment actually does not reflect the learning that is being undertaken'. This alignment process should happen at the outset when the course is developed. As a result of this thinking, the assessment system chosen for this programme uses a lot of self-assessment and feedback which align with the teaching and learning processes. It is criterion referenced, 'so...I'm measuring against criteria but I'm also trying to show to students what they have learnt in going through the process'. The assessment strategies must promote reflection and thinking. This is important because students could reach a reasonable standard but they wouldn't have learnt what else they could do to do better. . In every course there is a 'what have you learnt assignment? ... on the basis that learning is a journey and we want them to reflect upon the journey they've just undertaken'. Andrew also thinks there is a tendency to over assess and is aware that 'over assessing can in fact limit or impede the learning'.

## 8.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 7

Part 3 in **Case Study 7: Peer review enriches the learning in a musical performance workshop**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Description of the assessment strategy

---

The performance workshop assessment strategy is both a formative and summative assessment of the students' instrumental and/or song writing performance skills. It takes place in each of the three years of the degree at NZQA levels 5-7. Students from the three years participate in the workshop together. Each student has to give four performances a semester. It is formative in the sense that students receive a lot of feedback and this gives them lots of things to work on for the next performance. Students are assessed by tutors against a set of criteria which includes technique, accuracy, musicianship and presentation for performers and creativity, accuracy, musicianship and presentation for songwriters. On the marking schedule, the four criteria have descriptive guidelines for each level and earn a mark out of 100. The students have a copy of the marking schedule so that they know what they are being assessed on.

Tutors also make written observations and critique on the assessment sheet which is given to the student. The idea of performance workshop is that it gives the students an opportunity to cover a variety of genre; students are offered the opportunity to work from a wide a range of music as possible. They may use the same piece of music twice for their performance. The first time it is defined as a work in progress and the second performance is expected to be of a far higher standard.

Peer review is a vital ingredient in the performance workshop. Students are required to comment and critique their peers' performance. This provides many benefits. The performer learns to be able to accept constructive criticism while the other students are 'learning to listen with a critical ear, so they are learning how to listen to music as a musician'. They can then take that learning into their own performance.

In order to get over the barrier students often face of giving feedback to their peers, the tutors and students at second and third years teach and model the skills of giving feedback to the first years. 'By the time the first years start to give feedback they have learnt the nature and character of the feedback from students from the other years and they have also learned a vocabulary for musical critique through this process. Andrew notes the difference between the first year students' comments and observations and the third years. 'The growth in musical awareness in musical understanding and in actually what is lying behind performance has grown considerably and that's reflected in the comments they give.'

The performer is also asked to comment on his/her own performance. By the third year 'they've learnt enough from their performances to know what is going wrong, why it's going wrong, and they can start to self correct'. The final part of the 'learning loop' is when the

students discuss the critique they have received with their teacher individually. All this feedback or 'feed forward' strengthens the next performance.



## 8.3 Motivation and purpose for adopting the assessment strategy - Case Study 7

Part 4 in **Case Study 7: Peer review enriches the learning in a musical performance workshop**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Motivation and purpose for adopting the assessment strategy

---

Part of the motivation for this assessment strategy came from Andrew's own background of music exams in which 'you learn specific repertoire, you play it in front of one person and you get a mark'. Reflecting on this experience Andrew decided that because most musicians perform in front of an audience, he would design the assessment by creating the audience and giving the students the opportunity to get used to performing in front of many people, as opposed to a single examiner. Performing in front of an audience helps the student to understand that there will be various reactions or attitudes to their performance. Andrew believes that this model is more effective in helping the students grow as performing musicians. He has tried to make the assessment 'as close to real life as possible by building in the element of receiving a range of feedback' and he finds that this gives people the chance to perform and review, adapt and improve. He has found that his Maori and Pacifica students and the students from Korea do well with this type of assessment.

### Strengths

---

The strengths of this assessment strategy are that the assessment is aligned with the learning so students feel well prepared for it. Feedback is immediate and involves self-assessment and tutor and peer review. The learning from feedback enables students to build each new performance on the ones before. The special feature is that while the person performing is learning from receiving the feedback, at the same time all the other students are learning from giving the feedback. The people who are good at self-assessment and critiquing will know about the relationship between the effort they put into it and the outcome. 'They know how to apply what they've learnt - knowledge is useless unless you apply it ... this model helps them learn to apply their knowledge.'

### Limitations

---

The larger the class, the harder it would be to give all students the opportunity to participate in the student review aspect of it. However because students do not know in advance who will be selected to give a review, everyone has to do the thinking, listening and be prepared to comment.

To give four performances in a 16 week semester means that students have to prepare new work quickly. However because this is an important skill for a musician to learn, even though it is not specifically part of the assessment criteria, it is a useful practice.

## 8.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 7

Part 5 in **Case Study 7: Peer review enriches the learning in a musical performance workshop**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

The first year students are sometimes a bit daunted by the process and concerned at the nature of the comments they might receive. After they have been through the process once or twice they realise its value both from the performance aspect and from the review aspect and 'they've understood the value of performing, performing, and performing again and again'. Students also come to recognise they have responsibility for their learning and that they will get as much from it as they put in.

#### Response from colleagues

---

Andrew believes that his colleagues like the strategy because they can see that it is working.

#### Sharing the strategy

---

Andrew can see the value in sharing this strategy with others but has not had the chance to do so to date. He thinks it lends itself to performing arts programmes.

## 9 Case Study 8: Individual assessment takes place within a competitive group activity

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

### The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Terry McLoughlin

**Organisation:** Salvation Army Employment Plus

**Email:** [t.mcloughlin@eplus-salvationarmy.org.nz](mailto:t.mcloughlin@eplus-salvationarmy.org.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

#### In brief

---

**'While the competition is going on, they are giving a commentary on what they see this one doing well and not doing well and through that the tutor is working out what they have grasped and what further learning they need.'**

Terry finds that this assessment strategy works really well with her client group, particularly the young men, many of whom have built up a barrier to learning after leaving secondary school with low or no qualifications.

This strategy, in which individual students are assessed within a group activity such as fencing or a tractor driving competition, promotes students' engagement with the learning. It also allows students to be working on an individual training plan and progressing at their own pace. Within the fencing unit standards, there are a range of interrelated skills. During the group activity, some students might be being assessed on their ability to identify electric fencing components and tie a range of knots while others might have completed this unit standard and instead be assessed on installing posts and battens for fencing. However they can all participate in the competition at their level.

Students are also encouraged to give feedback on others' performance and this provides valuable information to the tutor about the student's understanding of the skill being demonstrated.

Students enjoy the rivalry and competition. They are relaxed as they have developed a close relationship with each other. The assessment is seen as fun rather than a formal test. They gain a sense of accomplishment in their achievement.

## 9.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 8

Part 2 in **Case Study 8: Individual assessment takes place within a competitive group activity**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### About the tertiary teacher

---

Terry McLoughlin is the Waikato Programme Manager for the Salvation Army Employment Plus PTE which has 7 centres in the Waikato and about 240 training places. Terry is involved with trade training for employment for Youth Training students, which is targeted funded training for under 18 year olds with low or no qualifications. Most of the training is at levels 1 and 2 on the NQF. Some of the students that Terry works with are 'school exemption kids or young people who haven't really finished their basic secondary schooling'.

Terry is responsible for course development and has designed the programme, assessments and the course materials that support the delivery of the trade courses in the Waikato region.

Terry was trained as a secondary teaching and taught English and History so when she started working for the Salvation Army 20 years ago she became the literacy and numeracy tutor before going into the work based training area. Her knowledge of assessment comes from her teacher training but equally from her experience designing assessments which involve unit standards.

### Views of assessment and assessment trends

---

Terry likes assessments to have substance and is concerned that some of the ITO assessments which are appropriate in the context of workplace assessment are not so suitable in the training environment. At moderation meetings she sometimes finds there is a preoccupation with administrative detail rather than the actual standards of the students' learning. In addition she is sometimes sceptical about the prescriptiveness around model answers. If a student does not come up with the model answer 'then its not correct when in fact it could have been a better answer'.

While seeing advantages with unit standards for her group of learners in that they are nationally recognised, the skill is defined, and they increase consistency in delivery across the organisation, Terry also thinks they make learning less realistic when they separate out tasks and assess them in isolation. In some cases, the unit standard does not require the skill to be demonstrated in a realistic setting. For example, 'one of the unit standards asks that the learner install and dismantle a temporary electric fence, so someone could come and put it up here (pointing to her office) and could pass the test'. Instead Terry expects student to demonstrate competence in 'different paddocks at different times ... because it is what they would need to do on the farm'.

She is also concerned that competency based assessment does not allow teachers to recognise differing levels of performance. She believes that it is helpful when assessment has a competitive element to it. 'I think it is good to know that some people are better at

some things than others and that competition, good competition, not the put down stuff, makes learning fun'.

## 9.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 8

Part 3 in **Case Study 8: Individual assessment takes place within a competitive group activity**. A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The assessment strategy assesses competence in unit standards from the National Certificate in Agriculture L2 in which students may be completing a number of level 2 and 3 unit standards such as identifying electric and non-electric fencing components and tying a range of knots, installing fencing wire, identifying, using and maintaining fencing tools, selecting fencing materials, installing posts and battens for fencing, demonstrating knowledge of fencing assemblies. Typically the students would be in groups of no more than 10 -12. The assessment is both formative and summative in that students are participating in a group activity ie a fencing competition where they may be being assessed for one or more unit standards while also learning and practising others.

The fencing competition would be set up and each student would compete within a specified timeframe. Although completion within a certain time is not part of the unit standard requirement, Terry believes that it is important for students to realise that it will be important in the workplace. While competing one by one, students are benefitting by watching each other, They are encouraged to point out what the competitor has got right and what is not right which they do in a 'spirit of friendly rivalry while at the same time reinforcing their own learning'. In this process, students also teach each other which they respond well to. There is a workbook which covers the more theoretical material which students work through and this contributes towards the development of literacy skills. The assessment of each student is recorded on an individual training plan to ensure that all aspects of the unit standard are assessed. Each student has his/her individual training plan and the tutor uses the individual plans to design the group activities and ensure that each person is working at their own pace and level.

### Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy

---

Students can start on this programme at any time and come with a wide range of attitudes, skills and abilities. Many of them also come with a barrier to learning after leaving secondary school with low or no qualifications.

It is necessary therefore to develop an individual training plan for each student. This strategy enables tutors to work effectively with each individual students so that they can progress at their own pace and according to their interests while also enabling group learning to take place. Terry finds that the group learning is very effective with the client group she works with and she finds they respond especially well to the challenge of a competition which is fun and which provides a sense of accomplishment. In a group, students form relationships and feel more relaxed and at ease which enhances their learning. They also enjoy learning from and teaching each other.

## 9.3 Purpose of the assessment strategy - Case Study 8

Part 4 in **Case Study 8: Individual assessment takes place within a competitive group activity**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### **Purpose of the assessment strategy**

---

To enable each individual student to learn and be assessed on their own learning plan while also participating in group learning activities in an efficient and effective way.

### **Strengths and limitations**

---

With its elements of fun and competition within a group, this strategy engages learners. Individuals can progress at their own pace and they can be assessed against one or more unit standards within the group activity. During the activity students receive feedback from the tutor and other students. Sometimes Terry says she will be standing with a student who 'starts to tell you what the person is doing wrong ... or missing out and you realise they've understood when they can assess someone else's performance correctly'. In this way its reinforcing the learning of all the group. It is also an authentic assessment which takes place in the work environment and requires students to demonstrate competence within a timeframe that is similar to a work situation. The workbooks and one-to-one assistance increase literacy and numeracy skills. Because these skills are taught in context, students 'want to find out because its in an area they are interested in' and thus they are developing their literacy/numeracy skills without it being specified as a separate task.

The strategy does require careful management by the tutor. The learning and assessment are structured and documented with an efficient set of tools to record where each student is at. Each unit standard has its own workbook so that the achievement of the learning outcomes can be recorded. Each month the tutor meets with students individually. During the meeting the past month is reviewed and the next month is planned and recorded in the training plan. There is also a group record which ties in with the individual plans and determines the group activities. Terry explains that 'it looks like a lot of paper, but it is actually very streamlined and it also covers all the quality compliance issues as well'.

It is a system of learning and assessment which works very effectively with small groups of learners. Terry believes that it works well for the large number of Maori and Pasifika students that take part in this programme.

## 9.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 8

Part 5 in **Case Study 8: Individual assessment takes place within a competitive group activity**. A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

Students enjoy the rivalry of the competition and companionship of teaching and learning from each other and take pride in their accomplishments. Those who have developed learning barriers from their school experiences, begin to overcome them.

#### Response from colleagues

---

One of Terry's colleagues wrote up the structure of the course and the assessment strategy for an assignment for the Diploma in Adult Teaching. This created some more reflection on the course. There is a constant reflection and improvement going on amongst the team.

#### Dissemination

---

This strategy is used across the organisation and Terry trains tutors to use it but it has not been disseminated externally.



# 10 Case Study 9: Gathering evidence of competence from a range of sources

A case study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

## The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Dave Sheely

**Organisation:** Fairview Educational Services Limited

**Email:** [jhorrigan@fairviews.co.nz](mailto:jhorrigan@fairviews.co.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

### In brief

---

**'In our assessment, we try to use as many angles and evidence sources as we can... and gather the evidence that already exists so we can reduce the number of formal assessments.'**

This assessment strategy has been driven by the need for students' success and retention. Over assessment and a lot of written and formal assessments have been what 'students have run away from at school ...we want to test what students know rather than how well they can write'.

One of the goals was to reduce the number of assessment items through gathering evidence from a range of sources rather than using a lot formal assessments when students have already been observed demonstrating the required skills and knowledge.

Observations in the workshops, completion of workbooks, job sheets and job cards from work experience placements where a particular skill has been done consistently and been signed off by the supervisor are all used to assess students' knowledge and skills in automotive servicing.

Feedback from students about the old theory assessments was that they were a 'marathon with a pen and tested what students could remember and how well they could write rather than what they knew and could understand. This new assessment strategy works much better for them.

# 10.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 9

Part 2 in **Case Study 9: Gathering evidence of competence from a range of sources**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

## About the tertiary teacher

---

Dave Sheely is a tutor at Fairview Educational Services, a PTE which offers specialist training in automotive engineering and panel beating. Dave is currently teaching on the Youth funded and Skill Enhancement courses.

Dave has completed assessment courses such as Workplace Assessment and Design Assessments. He has also completed the Certificate in Adult Teaching and is working on the Level 5 qualification in Adult teaching and learning. Although Dave did not design the courses, he is involved in updating and developing the assessments.

He has found that participating in the Learning for Living project which has aimed to build an infrastructure to support good quality literacy, numeracy and language teaching has been an extremely useful professional development opportunity.

## Views of Assessment and assessment trends

---

Dave believes that assessment strategies should be driven by the needs of the students, giving them a chance to achieve success and demonstrate their skills and understanding. This means they need to be given lots of opportunities to apply their learning and evidence of their competence should be collected from a range of sources.

One of the important aspects of the teaching and assessment at Fairview Educational Services is the emphasis on developing students' literacy skills. However it is a fine balance because students should not be required to have high levels of literacy to succeed. Written assessments use a range of strategies such as short answers, tick boxes, gap fills, key word tables, diagrams in order to make them achievable for the students.

One of the reasons that Fairview staff are developing new assessments is because they think that the theory assessments from the ITO had become outdated, inflexible and unrealistic and they were 'not very user friendly'. Fairview Educational Services have tried to change the style of assessment 'to test what students know rather than what they can remember which typically was what the old test papers did'.

## 10.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 9

Part 3 in **Case Study 9: Gathering evidence of competence from a range of sources**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

At Fairview Educational Services, the assessment strategy collects evidence of competence from a wide range of sources to verify students' learning. Observations in the workshops, completion of workbooks, job sheets and job cards from work experience placements where a particular skill has been done consistently and been signed off by the supervisor are all used to assess students' knowledge and skills in automotive servicing at NQF level 2. Some times evidence is gained over a period of time in an integrated way. For example for the unit on the use of hand tools, students would work on these skills for three to four months and evidence that they had mastered them would be gained from a variety of other assessments. If the students are being assessed on changing the brake fluid in a car, they would have to use hand tools and they would therefore be demonstrating these skills. Therefore there is no need to assess these skills again in a separate assessment. The benefit of this approach is that evidence is gathered as it arises so that students do not have to do a lot of formal assessments. This works really well for the students that attend Fairview Educational Services' courses because many of them have not experienced success and achievement at school.

Students also complete a range of written assessments. These are important because 'the literacy demands for a mechanic as cars become more sophisticated have become reasonably high and the industry is requiring people with higher literacy and numeracy skills.'

Tutors at Fairview Educational Services have been taking part in the Learning for Living project and have had training in how to introduce literacy development into their teaching. Literacy skills are improved through the use of workbooks. Even with practically assessed units, students work through a workbook while also learning in the workshop. While students are working on theory, there may be a literacy tutor, team teaching with an automotive tutor. The literacy tutor introduces literacy strategies and uses games and activities to build up students' literacy skills. For example the key words students will need to know in a unit are taught before students begin on the workbook.

Students work in groups of 10-12 but each of them will be working at their own pace on an individual learning plan and assessment is done on an individual basis when a student is ready. Dave finds this works well with Maori and Pasifika students. They respond to the way he relates to each of them on a personal basis, shares stories and experiences with them and develops 'the personal relationship' rather than a tutor/student one.

The students' attitude and behaviour is also taken into account in the assessment. Dave believes that 'attitude is of key importance and is therefore an important component of

assessment... I'm not saying they have to be angels but they have to demonstrate that their behaviour would be appropriate in the workplace'.

#### Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy

The assessment strategy has been driven by the need for students' success and retention. Over assessment and a lot of written and formal assessments have been what 'students have run away from at school ...we want to test what students know rather than how well they can write'.

One of the goals was to reduce the number of assessment items through gathering evidence from a range of sources rather than using a lot formal assessments when students have already been observed demonstrating the required skills and knowledge.

The literacy levels of many of the students meant that it was important to reduce the amount of writing required in assessments. Short answers, tick boxes, gap fills, key word tables are used instead of paragraph or essay type tests. In addition, the assessments test the application of knowledge rather than 'decontextualised' knowledge. For example, students might be given a case study where they identify at least five instances where health and safety rules were broken rather than asked to write a paragraph on health and safety rules. Putting the knowledge into context and how it might be applied in the workshop makes it much easier for students to demonstrate their understanding.

## 10.3 Purpose of the assessment strategy - Case Study 9

Part 4 in **Case Study 9: Gathering evidence of competence from a range of sources**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Purpose of the assessment strategy

---

To assess students' knowledge and understanding without using a lot of formal tests which require long written answers.

### Strengths and limitations

---

Students demonstrate their knowledge and understanding without using a lot of formal tests which require high levels of literacy.

The assessment strategy gathers evidence that already exists rather than using formal assessments when students have already been observed demonstrating the skills.

The strategy allows tutors to assess more than one unit standard at one time. While students are completing one task they will be demonstrating a range of skills for example use of hand tools, and measuring equipment, disassembly and safety skills. There will not be a need to assess these skills again in a separate assessment.

Written assessments are designed to test what students know rather than how well they can write and what they know rather than what they can remember.

With all unit standards, there is a question about how much of the learning is retained over a long period of time. 'Once you sign off a student they tend to think they won't need to do it again. ...One thing you could do would be to not sign students off on any unit standards until the end of the year but the reality is they would lose interest and one of the strengths of unit standards is students are getting feedback straight away and a sense of achievement - this is very important'. Formative assessment, which requires students to put the learning from a variety of unit standards together is therefore used as a way of overcoming this problem.

## 10.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 9

Part 5 in **Case Study 9: Gathering evidence of competence from a range of sources**. A case study from Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

Feedback from students about the old theory assessments was that the language used was beyond them, diagrams were poor and there were too many questions. Staff have taken this on board and are responding to the challenge of developing 'user friendly' and high quality assessments.

#### Response from colleagues

---

Staff are now involved in writing and moderating the assessments. As a result there is a lot of 'buy in'. Through this process the staff are developing their professional skills. They are responding to the challenge of developing assessments which include enough of the elements to make them valid without over assessing.

#### Dissemination

---

Staff from Fairview presented a workshop on integrating literacy into training at the Industry Training Federation conference.

Fairview Educational Services have made a collegial move to share the assessments they are developing with other providers as a way to end up with high quality assessment material. The other providers do not pay for the assessments as they do with the ITO which charges \$50 per assessment but they are required to give feedback. They see the benefits of working collaboratively and this is also evident in the moderation they do with other providers. For example the automotive tutor from a high school may come and spend the day with them sharing ideas.

# 11 Case Study 10: An assessment which promotes networking and community development

A Case Study from the Private Training Establishment (PTE) sector. Part of the Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment project.

## The Private Training Establishment Sector

---

**Name:** Lyn Roberts-Thomson

**Organisation:** CPS

**Email:** [lyn@cps.org.nz](mailto:lyn@cps.org.nz)

**Researcher:** Rosanne Matheson

### In brief

---

**'There is an African poem which says 'It takes a whole village to raise a child'. This assessment strategy has a flow on effect, building networks to protect children in the community.'**

The strategy is partly motivated by the need to assess a lot of knowledge and a range of skills in a short time frame. At a deeper level, the purpose is to contribute to networking, child advocacy and community development in communities throughout New Zealand.

The assessment requires participants in a five day Child Protection Studies course to research a service available to help children in their community. They must present the information in a fact sheet and oral presentation. Through both the fact sheet, which is displayed on the wall during the course and the oral presentation, everyone in the course gains a broader knowledge of the organizations involved in protecting children in their community.

The assessment is designed to cater for a diverse range of students and be accessible to everyone. Participants say they gain a great sense of accomplishment from researching and presenting their fact sheet. They also develop a rapport with the organization they investigate and networks which assist them in the future and can often strengthen the community as a whole.

# 11.1 About the tertiary teacher - Case Study 10

Part 2 in **Case Study 10: An assessment which promotes networking and community development.** A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment.*

## About the tertiary teacher

---

Lyn Roberts-Thomson is Academic Services Manager at CPS. She was not involved in developing the course which has been running for many years but is involved in the six monthly reviews of the course and the changes and updating that result from that process.

## Views of Assessment and assessment trends

---

Lyn's knowledge of assessment comes from her Early Childhood Teacher training, completion of Workplace Assessor training and the Certificate in Adult Teaching. She also learns from her CEO who is knowledgeable about assessment and through reading and experience.

Lyn believes that assessment should be aligned with and contribute to the learning outcomes of the course and in turn the skills required in the field people are training for. Child advocacy requires oral presentation, networking and collaboration skills and the assessments help participants to develop and practice these skills. She also likes assessments which have both an oral and written component because this means that 'people with different strengths can succeed in demonstrating their knowledge'.

Lyn believes that unit standard based assessment is much better than the 'university exam,,, in which there was a mad dash panic sort of study just before an exam'. She likes assessment practices which require the learner to apply their learning on a practical level. She also thinks unit standards have the advantage of making the required learning explicit to the learners. She has found that competency based assessment suits people who have not had a lot of academic success and gives a sense of achievement and motivation. However other students who have had more formal educational experience tend to ask 'what was my mark and the competent or not competent result does always suit these people'.



## 11.2 Description of the assessment strategy - Case Study 10

Part 3 in **Case Study 10: An assessment which promotes networking and community development**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Description of the Assessment Strategy

---

The assessment strategy requires participants in the 5 day Child Protection Studies course to research a service available to help children in their community. The course includes a couple of unit standards at level 3 but is a provider rather than a national qualification. Participants begin the assessments prior to the commencement of the course. This course is attended by a diverse group of people interested in child protection with a wide range of previous formal learning experience.

Participants must present information in a fact sheet and oral presentation. Guidelines about what the fact sheet must include are given along with course confirmation about three weeks before the course starts. Participants select an organization and gather the required information through interviews, written sources such as pamphlets, annual reports and the internet. The fact sheet must include information about the background of a service which helps children, its mission statement, service provision, cost to the client and contact details. How the agency provides for people of different cultures also needs to be included. Participants are asked to present this information in such a way that it can be displayed on the wall on day three of the five day course. This gives people a couple of days during the course to do a 'bit of tweaking' before putting their fact sheet on the wall. Some fact sheets are presented 'in a very visual style while others are more theoretical and wordy'. On the fifth day of the course, students give an oral presentation, explaining the key points of the organization they have researched and answering questions. They are not assessed on their presentation skills as such but the presentation is an opportunity for any gaps in the Fact Sheet to be given. There is another reason for participants to present the Fact Sheet orally and that is 'to be a strong child advocate, we have to speak out and be willing to put our point of view across ... this give participants a chance to practice these skills'.

This assessment requires participants to demonstrate skills of community networking and child advocacy both of which are key learning outcomes of the course. It is also an effective assessment strategy in that it contributes to the learning of all the participants in the course. Through both the fact sheet and the presentation, everyone gains a broader knowledge of the organizations involved in protecting children in their community. While the fact sheets are on the wall, all participants are encouraged to read the information and develop some understanding of the organization and questions they would like to ask when the information is presented orally on the last day. Sometimes the information is photocopied and collated into a resource which all participants can take away with them.

## 11.3 Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy - Case Study 10

Part 4 in **Case Study 10: An assessment which promotes networking and community development**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Motivation for adopting the assessment strategy

---

The assessment is partly motivated by the need to assess a lot of knowledge and a range of skills in a short time frame. However it is also motivated by the desire to contribute to networking and community development in the communities throughout New Zealand where it is offered.

Because participants come from a wide range of backgrounds and of formal education, the assessment needs to cater for these differences. By utilizing a combination of written and oral skills, the assessment allows people with differing strengths to succeed. This in turn achieves the goal of making these courses accessible to everyone.

### Purpose of the assessment strategy

---

The assessment strategy allows students to develop their knowledge and understanding of services for children in their community and to build the skills of networking and presentation.

### Strengths and limitations

---

Using this assessment, which students partially complete prior to the course, means they can cover a lot more information than would otherwise be possible in a five day course. 'To get all these organizations to come in and talk over the five day course would be impractical but if you have 25 people on the course, you have got 25 different organizations being profiled'.

Students research and prepare a fact sheet about a service available to help children in the community and then present the information to the group. The strategy builds the skills of networking, collaboration and advocacy which are key learning outcomes of the course.

Tutors need to have excellent listening and questioning skills. They assess the fact sheets which are on the wall during the week and analyse what has not been included and the questions that will need to be asked during the oral presentation. The strategy could work with large classes but it would need to be structured differently. A large group could be broken into smaller groups for the presentation. This may lessen some of the strong bonds that are built within the group as a whole. Sometimes when there are a lot of presentations, they are spread out throughout the week.

## 11.4 Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy - Case Study 10

Part 5 in **Case Study 10: An assessment which promotes networking and community development**. A case study from *Enhancing the Effectiveness of Tertiary Teaching and Learning through Assessment*.

### Receiving feedback and sharing the strategy

---

#### Response from students

---

Students say they gain a great sense of accomplishment from researching and presenting their fact sheets. They also develop a rapport with the organization they investigate and networks which assist them in the future. In the post course reports, participants say that they found out information which they have been able to refer a client to, so they see their learning as 'providing a longer term benefit for the community'.

#### Response from colleagues

---

Tutors also find that they learn a lot of knowledge about community services from the students which they can take and use in another course.

#### Dissemination

---

This strategy is not shared outside the organisation. However the course is offered nationally and communities benefit from the community resource that is created when the factsheets are compiled into a collection of the services available to help children in the community.