Central Regional Hub-funded project

Puanga Te Matapae Oranga:
A professional development toolkit for enriching tutor-student engagement and enhancing student learning autonomy

Anne Greenhalgh & Dr Lesley Petersen

AKO
AOTEAROA™

Project undertaken by:
Workforce Development Ltd

Central Regional Hub Fund

Published by Ako Aotearoa
PO Box 756
Wellington 6140
March 2019

Table of Contents

Executive Summary

"I really feel this was a great exercise and something I wish to continue. It has really helped my teaching but also my wanting to continue in this position due to the first time in a long time feeling supported and listened to."

Introduction

This project builds on an earlier Hub-funded project which identified key tutor practices that positively correlate with successful completion for Māori students within a PTE environment; and developed the concept of Puanga Te Matapae Oranga (Puanga) as a guiding philosophy for tutor practices (Greenhalgh, Tipa-Rogers & Hunter, 2011). To authenticate and sustain these good teaching practices, this project developed and trialled two reflective strategies underpinned by the principles of Puanga which establishes a pathway of engagement between the tutor and student and assists in student learning autonomy. The two strategies were a reflective journal - the Puanga Reflective Journal - and three discipline team-based communities of practice (CoP).

The aim of Puanga is to challenge the tutors to reflect on their practice and identify what they currently do to influence and support successful student learning, what they need to change, and how they can plan for this. A key output of the project is the Puanga kete, which comprises reflective tools and strategies that support tutors in self-reflection and provide mechanisms to encourage collective reflection, sharing of teaching practices, and learning from each other. The kete includes i) The Puanga Reflective Journal; ii) Communities of Practice (CoP) Guidelines; iii) a CoP Meeting Structure Guideline; and iv) A peer observation and review process.

Over a six-month period, tutors in three departments of Workforce Development Limited (WDL), a Private Training Establishment (PTE) situated in three North Island regions met every six weeks as a CoP during which they shared reflections from their Puanga Reflective Journal (the Journal). A peer observation and review process framed within Puanga was also developed to promote discussion about and reflection on effective teaching and learning practices. As the project progressed, it was decided early on that trialling the peer observation and review process was unrealistic, given the expectation of the tutors to engage in regular CoP meetings and use the time between meetings to use their Journal for ongoing reflection on practice, plus manage the day to day requirements of their job. Tutors will begin formally engaging in peer observation in early 2019.

Puanga can be applied at three levels:
1. For the individual tutor as a mechanism for reflection on and action to enhance their teaching practice;

2. Support and encourage peer review and feedback via the tutors' Community of Practice (CoP) (designed in previous Hub-funded project and now embedded in WDL's professional development infrastructure);
3. Teacher development across the vocational and tertiary education sector.

Project Aims

The central aim of this project was to develop tools that provide tutors with strategies that support their pedagogical practice, encourage them to analyse their cultural lens, and prompt critical, ongoing reflection, as an individual and in a collective capacity. Secondary aims included:

- Increased tutor confidence in utilising a bi-cultural approach to teaching, linking Western models and perspectives to Te Ao Māori;
- Enhancement of tutors' reflection on their practice to identify what they currently do to support student learning and what they need to change; and
- Establishment of action plans by the tutors for enhancing and improving their teaching practice.

Method

The central premise of Puanga is 'engagement'. Engagement between teacher and learner, between teachers, and between learners. This was achieved through collaborative activities and methods to support and encourage application of Puanga in their teaching practice, including:

1. Conversations and collaboration via six-weekly discipline-based CoP meetings conducted face to face and online;
2. Regular reflection using the Journal as a source of capturing and documenting their thoughts, ideas, and intentions for student learning;
3. Contribution of resources, templates and other teaching and learning strategies to a web-based resource repository, articles, reflective journal entries, teaching strategies, website links.

Twelve tutors across three departments – Early Childhood Education (ECE), Youthwork (YW) and Foundation Education (Foundation) – met six-weekly in their respective team's CoP, using the Journal as a tool to think about and document their reflections which they could choose to share with each other. Importantly, the Journal became a tool for their critical reflection that could inform action plans for desired and required changes in their teaching practice. The project mentor acted as a facilitator and coordinator of the three CoPs.

An online questionnaire sent to all tutors at the conclusion of the project gathered their feedback about the effectiveness, impact, and outcomes of Puanga Te Matapae Oranga on their teaching practice and student achievements. The questionnaire asked for the tutors'

feedback on the value and benefits of the CoP meetings and the Journal, as well as asking them to consider how they influence and encourage student learning autonomy.

The original plan had been to commence the project with a training workshop for the tutors which would: i) explain the concept and values of Puanga; ii) explain the peer observation process and set up a teacher observation schedule; iii) discuss how they can apply Puanga in their practice; and iv) describe the expectations of the tutors' engagement in the project using Puanga as a self-driven development tool. Due to several logistical challenges, the workshop did not go ahead. However, the tutors had been involved in a Puanga training session prior to the project commencing so entered the project with knowledge and understanding of Puanga principles and philosophy. WDL see the value in engaging the tutors in a second Puanga workshop which has been scheduled for early 2019. This will provide the three teams with an opportunity to come together and share their insights and learnings from the project.

The project still aims to collect the student voice via focus group (FG) interviews with students across the three departments, however these will now be conducted in early 2019. It was decided not to conduct the interviews as the six-month project time-frame has provided a starting point for the tutors to gain a comprehensive understanding of Puanga through engagement in and use of the reflection strategies implemented, apply the principles of critical reflection in their practice, and evaluate the influence and impact of these on their teaching and on student learning. WDL intends to conduct a follow-on project which will further embed Puanga through centralising the student voice.

Findings

(i) The CoP for the Foundation tutors is now embedded in WDL's professional development infrastructure. Provision of a CoP for the YW and ECE teams has extended the reach and opportunity for tutors to collaborate, share their teaching experiences, discuss and seek solutions to teaching and learning challenges, and learn from each other;

(ii) The combination of the Journal and the CoPs has provided multiple vehicles which prompt the tutors to engage in critical reflection on their practice;

(iii) All participants felt that they had benefitted significantly from their experience as members of a CoP, as it provided a place for them to analyse their thinking about teaching, share good teaching practices, help each other manage teaching challenges and identify strategies that support student learning autonomy and learning outcomes;

(iv) Based on the tutors' feedback and the discussions generated in the CoP meetings, the Journal has been revised, incorporating a sixth challenge and additional reflective questions. The Journal is one of the key outputs from this project.

1   Introduction

"The primary benefit of reflective practice for teachers is a deeper understanding of their own teaching style and ultimately greater effectiveness as a teacher." (Ferraro, 2000).

This project builds on two earlier Ako Aotearoa Hub-funded projects: '*The Identification of Key Tutor Practices that are Positively Correlated with Successful Completion for Māori Students within a PTE Environment*' and '*Establishing Communities of Practice: A pedagogy development mechanism for teachers in the NZ Private Training Establishment environment*' (available from https://akoaotearoa.ac.nz/). Two reflective strategies were trialled underpinned by the principles of Puanga including the Puanga Reflective Journal and three discipline team-based CoPs. The Journal and the CoPs were far more productive in prompting the tutors to reflect than "*merely advocating reflective practice and assuming the tutors would make a difference to their teaching practice*" (Russell, 2006, p.199).

Participative action research methodology guided the design, implementation and evaluation of this project, with the project mentor playing an integral role as CoP facilitator. Each tutor received a copy of the Journal which posits five challenges for tutors to critically examine and reflect on their teaching practices. A sample taken from the Journal is attached as *Appendix A*; the full resource is downloadable from the project page on Ako Aotearoa's website (www.akoaotearoa.ac.nz).

The project commenced with the project mentor conducting face to face meetings with the three tutor teams to clarify the project purpose and the establishment of the CoPs, introduce the peer observation and review process, explain the concept of Puanga and the application of the Puanga Reflective Journal within their CoP meetings. The CoPs were established using the CoP Guidelines developed in one of the earlier Ako Aotearoa Hub-funded projects and adapted to reflect the purpose, process and activities of this project (*refer Appendix B*).

As the project progressed it was decided that the tutors would formally engage in peer observations beginning 2019.

The primary sources of data included:

i)   Transcribed minutes of the CoP meetings, summarising the tutors' discussion points and any shared reflections, strategies and/or resources;

ii)   A sample of reflections provided by the tutors at the conclusion of the project;

iii)   A summative online questionnaire conducted with the tutors at the conclusion of the project to collect their feedback on the CoP meetings and the use of the Journal

1.1 The Tutor Teams

The Foundation team is based in the Hawke's Bay region and had been meeting as a CoP for two years prior to the commencement of this project. The team had participated in the earlier Hub-funded project "*Establishing Communities of Practice*" completed in 2016 and continued their CoP as a professional development initiative within WDL. Incorporation of the Journal was a new initiative for the team, introducing another construct for their meetings and discussions.

The ECE and YW team members are based at three WDL campuses in the North Island, in Auckland, Hawke's Bay and Lower Hutt. Although both teams were familiar with using video conferencing technology for their regular team meetings with the Head of Department (HoD), the CoP was a new initiative.

2 The Findings

2.1 The Puanga Reflective Journal

"The journal is encouraging me to look at my current practice and giving me ideas of other approaches that I may take towards teaching moving forward."

The Journal was developed as a reflective tool to prompt the tutors' thinking about their practice. They were encouraged to use the Journal throughout the project time-frame, to reflect on practice between the CoP meetings and to share their reflections within the CoP meetings. Allan and Driscoll (2014) identify several benefits of reflective writing, such as aiding student learning and engaging teachers in professional development. They also state that reflective writing is a process that reveals effective practices and areas needing improvement.

The Journal has five challenges framed by the principles of Puanga, accompanied by reflective questions that encouraged the tutors to reflect on their practice in relation to each challenge. Table 1 provides examples of the tutors' reflections which they brought to the CoP meetings to share, discuss and consider their practice. *Appendix C* provides more tutor reflections, illustrating the depth and breadth of their thinking about their practice.

Table 1　　　Tutor Reflections

CHALLENGE 1 I reflect on practice – what do I need to change?	*"Natural Learning: A teachable moment to me is something significant which happens when learners achieve. It could be something as simple as gaining praise from peers that gives them confidence to keep going. For me when these moments happen, I need to allow more time for discussion."* *"I ask the students how I could incorporate other content into the curriculum. They have expressed an interest in a particular topic."*
CHALLENGE 2 I know my cultural lens – how is it influencing my student' progress?	*"I enjoy learning about my students' values and beliefs. I encourage them to share these as I learn from this too."* *"Placing learners into a single learning style 'box' ignores the reality of the whole person. Therefore, through Te Ao Kori learning from your learners shows appreciation and acknowledgement of student's prior knowledge and affirms individual effort."*

CHALLENGE 3 What do I have to share? I do have something to share	"*If I want my students to be honest with me, I need to be honest with them. Every morning I greet the students then we discuss what we got up to the night before. I have also discussed hardships I have experienced in my life prompting students to discuss problems they have encountered; this has led to some heart-breaking stories. This allows me to know my learners and them to know me. Knowing my students allows me to value and utilise their knowledge.*"
CHALLENGE 4 What can I learn? I have something to learn	"*I enjoy relationship building and do this easily. I am a hands-on person who takes care not to offend others when I am tutoring keeping learners and my peers mana intact at all times. Being respectful is important to me and so is working with a holistic approach to learning for learners.*" "*Because I enjoy sharing my knowledge and life experiences with others and hope that I can have a positive effect on others.*"
CHALLENGE 5 How do I regard my students?	"*Kaha: I myself regard learning as a pivotal part of my existence and to be able to share new skills, knowledge and be part of motivating others is exciting. It is a journey you undertake together in which you make a commitment to participate in activities or opportunities that may be provided. The success for me has been seeing the learner gain in knowledge and skills that have given them more opportunities than what they had prior. Employment opportunities, further training or a new set of skills will keep our minds strong and healthy.*" "*By sharing my own experiences and asking them to share theirs. Encouraging them to talk/work through any previous negative experiences regarding learning.*"

During several CoP meetings, tutors shared their reflections and discussed the usefulness of the Journal as a tool for their practice. They also identified some challenges in their teaching as well as challenges their students can face. Poor student attendance and lack of communication from the students about this was mentioned, as well as managing the expectations and demands of the job role. One tutor talked about workload and lack of direct communication with people outside their campus, whilst another tutor expressed challenges with planning.

In response to the CoP conversations and the examples of teaching and learning challenges provided by the tutors, the Journal was revised to incorporate a sixth challenge with corresponding reflective questions. These are:

Challenge 6
How do I navigate external challenges that impact on my teaching practice and impact on the students?

Reflective Questions:
1. What strategies do I use to assist students with literacy and numeracy skill development?

2. How do I manage student behaviour that has a potentially negative impact on the other students? For example, disrespect, rudeness.

3. How do I support students who have emotional issues?

4. How do I manage poor attendance and students' lack of preparation for class?

5. What do I do to ensure I have the necessary resources to support the students' learning?

New reflective questions were also added to two of the original challenges. For example, two additional questions in Challenge 1 were: "*How do I know the students are learning?*" and "*What changes do I observe in the students that tells me they are learning*". In Challenge 4, the question "*How do I learn from my students?*" was added.

Summative Questionnaire

Question One in the summative online questionnaire asked the tutors to comment on how the Journal had influenced their teaching practice. Their feedback is summarised below:

"The Puanga reflective journal has helped me reflect on my teaching practice so that I can better engage and motivate my learners."

"It has helped me become more aware of the holistic learning and teaching practices and to reflect on my teaching style."

"By encouraging me to look at my current practice and it has given me ideas of other approaches that I may take towards teaching moving forward."

"The journal has given me a bit more focus on what I can reflect on."

"It has allowed me to reflect on my practice and change some aspects of my teaching, for example, being more flexible."

"It has made me more aware of my teaching practice."

"It has helped by making me think more about how to deliver course content in a way that the students can understand."

2.2   The CoP Meetings

"I have found that just by talking to supportive colleagues we have come up with different approaches of how I may do things differently, decide that I may need to find out more about a certain area and construct new meaning.

Each tutor team engaged in four two-hour CoP meetings which were held every six weeks. Because of the diverse campus locations, as described earlier, the ECE and YW teams participated online using Zoom video conferencing whilst the Foundation team met face to face. The online platform created a shared space and connected the tutors across the geographical boundaries; this was a key aspect of the project, to enable each team to meet and connect.

Pyrko, Dorfler, and Eden (2016) talk about processes that happen at the heart of CoPs: Knowledge development, knowledge sharing, an investment of identity, and a social formation of the individual. The CoPs provided a regular platform and space for each team to come together and explore the common ground of pedagogical practice and "*guide each other through their understandings of the same problems in their area of mutual interest*" (Pyrko et al., p. 389).

A formal structure to the meetings was not imposed on the tutors; they were encouraged to use the Journal as the catalyst for their conversations however were not limited to this. For example, a meeting could start with a group round of "*What's on top?*", providing an opportunity for the tutors to talk about what has been happening in their teaching. Or the meeting commenced with a tutor initiating the discussion by sharing a reflection from their Journal. Both approaches generated avid conversation within the groups, with the other tutors sharing and expressing their ideas and/or experiences in relation to the shared reflection.

During the meetings, invariably a tutor would comment on the benefits of the CoP, for themselves and for the team. Comments such as, "*This is a good time to reflect and share our stresses when we need to*" and "*It is great to have the opportunity to talk through what I am currently facing in my teaching*" indicated that the tutors were valuing being part of a CoP and achieving value-for-time in the meetings. The project mentor maintained a role as

11

initiator of the CoP discussions when the group commenced, then assumed a less active position for the duration of the meeting.

Summative Questionnaire

Two questions related to the CoP meetings were included in the summative questionnaire, generating a range of views from the tutors. Question Two asked them how they had benefitted from participating in a CoP with their team whilst Question Three asked the tutors to comment on how the CoP had influenced their teaching practice. Their responses are shown in Table 2.

Table 2   Benefits and influence of the CoP meetings

Benefits of participating in a CoP	Influence of the CoP on teaching practice
It has given me the chance to get to know the others in the team. Ka Mau Te Wehi	I feel more confident that I am on the right track and supporting the students well.
The Cop meetings have allowed me to speak openly about any issues I am having trouble with. Being there to share with each other has helped me come up with solutions and I have been able to help the other tutors at times too	It has made me think about what I can change in my behaviour/teaching practice and if it's something I can't change, I am able to ask my manager for support by asking "What do you think I could do about this?"
I have really enjoyed these meetings, finding them extremely supportive and they confirm to me that I am on the right track with my teaching.	The CoP has influenced my practice by making me more connected to my learners and being aware of the information I am relaying to them.
Lots of positive and constructive feedback which we haven't been given a lot of in the past. This is really important.	By the sharing of ideas and experiences with one another.
The fellowship has been a really positive for me. Being able to meet informally and share positives and negatives in a safe forum.	A learning tool for me to enhance authentic teaching and learning.
It has been great to learn from my colleagues and be able to share teaching delivery ideas.	It has enabled and allowed me to approach my teaching with new and different ideas.

One tutor commented that the CoP had "*not greatly*" influenced their practice but did not elaborate on this. Another tutor provided a list of strategies and teaching practices they were incorporating into their lessons, as a result of the sharing and discussions that had ensued in their CoP. These included:

- Student autonomy - through role-modelling
- Ako - through the student voice and creating a student-centred classroom
- Giving the students time
- Embracing teachable moments
- Reasonable expectations of individual students

2.3   The Summative Questionnaire: Three Final Questions

In addition to the first three questions about the benefits and influence of the Journal and the CoP meetings, a further three questions asked the tutors to consider how they support student learning autonomy and what difference reflecting on their practice made to their teaching and to student learning. These questions were reflective of the central aim of Puanga and therefore the focus of the tutors' participation in the project, that is, to 'enrich tutor-student engagement' and 'enhance student learning autonomy'. The tutors' responses to the questions regarding student learning autonomy are summarised in Table 3.

Table 3   Supporting student learning autonomy

What teaching strategies do you use to support student learning autonomy?	How do you create a learning environment that supports the development of student learning autonomy?
Using student input to direct projects (project-based learning), for example, decide what dishes to cook	Learner autonomy is developed by building respectful relationships with students. This gives them confidence to voice their opinions in a safe learning environment
Finding out what motivates them in their learning	Be welcoming and have a space that the students feel they belong to, e.g., student work spaces, students' work on the walls
Being prepared – well written course content supports this	Allowing students to 'have a voice' and listen and encourage their skill development and ideas
Getting to know my students	Small class sizes
Make the teaching and learning sessions interesting and relevant. E.g., groupwork, setting individual tasks, moving around the room	Creating an open, transparent environment where all learners feel valued, adopt Tuakana Teina philosophy, and support each other. I as the tutor learn from them as well
Ensuring that my teaching is student-focussed. Learner-led and also Ako	Openly acknowledging their strengths and working on lesser strengths
Using individual learning plans (ILPs) so they can take responsibility for their own learning goals and achievements	Playing games and individual time. Also having the learning resources such as handouts ready

Scaffolding the learning	By providing a safe place to not be judged
Asking their view instead of focusing on mine	By acknowledging what they have done well and positively suggesting ways their work could improve. I like students to work in small groups and report findings back to the bigger group. This supports them in knowing that they have most of the knowledge and I am just there to facilitate their learning. This in turn leads to learner autonomy

One tutor provided a comprehensive statement to describe how they support learner autonomy:

> "Teachable moments have been great as when a student asks a question about a topic that we are not studying at the moment, we can discuss their questions as I know that this is a time and opportunity where they want to learn. Giving students time to research topics on the internet also works well as they come back to class and we all discuss their findings. By positively acknowledging what they have discovered about a topic gives them more confidence to be autonomous. I have also found that working one-to-one when I can with a student provides them with the confidence to work on their own. I guess it builds the relationship between us too."

The final question asked the tutors to explain how reflecting on their teaching practice makes a difference to their teaching and to the students' learning. Whilst some comments were confirmation of reflection being an important activity for teachers to engage in, other tutors gave examples of the impact of reflection on their teaching and on student learning:

'Being reflective means I look at other ways of delivery and ask my learners for feedback on a regular basis."

"I have been able to think about and analyse how the lesson went and make changes according to what their understanding is."

"It means always being open and able to adjust to the current situation and reflecting back on things that have worked or not in the past. This makes it better for the learners. Reflection has always been a tool I have used in my teaching practice. It allows me to adapt my practice in light of things I feel I have done well and things I feel I could improve. This helps me to feel more confident about what I am teaching. The more I reflect, the better it is for students' learning and the more classes I teach hopefully the better the learning will be for the students."

"Changing. I have always found that reflecting on my teaching is good for constant changing."

"Reflecting on my practice is crucial to helping students achieve."

"It helps me be aware of what I am doing and how it affects everyone and how it affects outcomes for the students. It defines what you need support in and what you are doing well/what is working. It makes me a more positive and confident teacher which in turn offers the students a more positive learning experience."

"I am constantly reflecting on my practice, trying to produce a more effective, better quality product for my learners."

2.4   Key Themes Identified

2.4.1   Value of the Puanga Reflective Journal

"I think my teaching has changed, especially when I look back at some of my earlier reflections."

The purpose of the Journal was to provide a tool for prompting the tutors' ongoing reflection on their practice and act as a catalyst for them to share and discuss their practice with each other in the CoP. General discussion about the benefits and value of reflecting on practice occurred in conjunction with the tutors' sharing reflections from their Journal. For example:

"We naturally reflect on what we can't do or didn't do well. These questions are getting me to also think about what has worked and why it went well."
"Reflecting doesn't – and shouldn't – stop."

"Reflecting prompts me to introduce new ideas, activities and concepts that will enable the students to 'get' the learning."

During the meetings, the use and benefits of the Journal were regular discussion points, in addition to the tutors' reflection sharing. It was important to ascertain whether the tutors found the Journal a tool that supported and helped enhance their teaching practice. From the first CoP meeting through to the final meeting at the conclusion of the project, comments about the Journal's effectiveness were numerous, such as:

"It has prompted me to be more prepared and organised."

15

'It has made me think more deeply about my particular teaching style and how this influences the learners and the learning."

"I initially thought "not again" but I have found this is a good tool to remind me to reflect. It has also meant I can revisit my reflections as I have captured my thoughts in the Journal."

"The Journal has prompted me to realise I need to return to previous teaching approaches and resources that have worked in the past."

2.4.2   Value of the CoPs

> *"The CoP is a valuable time to get together and talk about teaching instead of the usual focus on administrative tasks."*

There was consensus across the three teams that coming together as a group of tutors in a CoP was highly beneficial. Comments like "*an opportunity to explore how we can develop ourselves as tutors*" and "*talk about our students and how we interact with them and support their learning*" are two examples indicating the tutors' perception of the CoP value.

The CoP meetings also provided a space for tutors to talk about other factors that impacted on their teaching, identifying several internal and external influences. For example, some discussions centred around managing stress and challenges within the job role:
"I do everything to engage learners but with all the other demands I feel like I'm not doing any teaching."

"I am trying to maintain my professionalism without losing it. It's exhausting."
At other times, the conversations highlighted the positive aspects of teaching and learning and organisational mechanisms that supported this. For example, one of the teams stated periodically, "*We have an awesome manager who regularly reminds us of how good we are at our job and is always asking us how they can support us.*"

2.4.3   Structure of the CoP

As described in 2.4.1 above, the CoP meetings were initially framed by the Journal, with each tutor considering at least one reflective question prior to each meeting and being prepared to share this with the other team members. As the project progressed and the teams became familiar with how they could use the CoP time, several tutors began suggesting other ways the meetings could be structured to leverage the benefits of them.

Everyone acknowledged the value of the Journal as a catalyst for reflection and team discussion, however other ideas for structuring the meetings included having a 'big word' that denoted the theme of a meeting, having an invited speaker, and tutors taking turns to present a specific topic or pose a question for discussion. The Foundation team had already

established a meeting structure following their participation in the earlier Hub-funded CoP project, which involved each team member preparing a mini teaching session of a topic they were teaching or working together on tasks and activities that influence their teaching such as moderation. A section of the meeting time was always dedicated to sharing reflections, which the Journal supported. As a result of the suggestions for different approaches to the CoP meeting structure and time-use, a CoP Meeting Structure Guideline has been developed as one of the tools in the Puanga kete (refer Appendix D).

3   Summary

Puanga Te Matapae Oranga establishes a pathway of engagement between the tutor and student and assists in student learning autonomy. This project aimed to challenge tutors working in three disciplinary teams to reflect on their practice and identify what they currently do to influence and support successful student learning, what they need to change, and how they can plan for this. Reflective tools were designed to assist the tutors in this, including the Puanga Reflective Journal, Communities of Practice and Meeting Structure Guidelines, a resource repository situated in WDL's intranet, and a peer observation and review process. These four strategies comprise the Puanga kete, the key output of the project.

The project plan had been to commence with a training workshop bringing all tutors together from across the three regions to explore and discuss the concept and practice of Puanga. This was a catalyst activity to launch the project and prepare the tutors for engagement in the project activities. Due to logistical challenges, the workshop was postponed and did not eventuate within the project time-frame. However, a training event is scheduled for January 2019 as part of a day-long staff hui. The advantage of this timing will be the opportunity for the tutors to reflect on the project and how this influenced their teaching practice and impact on their students. It will also enable WDL to follow up on the online summative questionnaire to gain clarification of some responses, providing more in-depth and meaningful data for the organisation to work with and/or act upon.

The Journal containing five challenges with corresponding reflective questions aimed to encourage the tutors to critically and regularly reflect on how they teach, how they impact student learning, and how they encourage student learning autonomy. It provided a tool for the tutors to construct their thinking and discussions in the CoP meetings.

As highlighted in this report, the tutors' feedback confirmed that they saw great value in coming together as a CoP in their respective teams as this provided them with opportunities to share ideas and experiences and explore solutions to teaching and learning issues. The CoP meetings combined with the Journal prompted meaningful conversations, with many tutors expressing greater insight into their teaching as a consequence. A Meeting Structure Guideline was added to the Puanga kete in response to several tutors saying they would like different options for structuring the CoP meetings in addition to using the Journal to frame the meeting discussions.

The three tutor CoPs trialled in this project will continue after the project conclusion with the intention to establish further CoPs for another tutor team and for the HoDs. McDermott (2000) states that a critical feature of CoP health is active leadership, which reflects the

approach WDL will take to ensure sustainability of this professional development support mechanism.

The Puanga kete - the key output of this project and presented in this report - is a resource transferable to other educational contexts and discipline cohorts for the provision of an ongoing, structured approach to tutor professional development comprising critical reflection, collaboration, and establishing learning communities within and across an organisation.

References

Allan, E.G., & Driscoll, L. (2014). The three-fold benefit of reflective writing: Improving program assessment, student learning, and faculty professional development. *Science Direct*, *21*, 37-55.

Cambridge, D., Kaplan, S., & Suter,V. (n.d.). *Community of practice design guide: A step-by-step guide for designing & cultivating communities of practice in higher education*. Retrieved from
https://transitiepraktijk.nl/files/Community%20of%20practice%20guide.pdf

Greenhalgh, A., Tipa-Rogers, K., & Hunter, R. (2011). *The identification of key tutor practices that are positively correlated with successful completion for Māori students within a PTE environment*. Retrieved from https://ako.ac.nz/knowledge-centre/

Ferraro, J.M. (2000). *Reflective practice and professional development*. Retrieved from https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED449120.pdf

McDermott, R. (2000). Knowing in community: 10 critical success factors in building communities of practice. *International Association for Human Resource Management 4*(1), 19–26.

Pyrko, I., Dorfler, V., & Eden, C. (2016). Thinking together: What makes communities of practice work? *Human Relations*, *70*(4), 389-409.

Russell, T. (2006). Can reflective practice be taught? *Reflective Practice*, *6*(2), 199-204.

Sanchez-Cardona, I., Sanchez-Lugo, J., & VZlez-Gonzalez, J. (2012). Exploring the potential of communities of practice for learning and collaboration in a higher education context. *Science Direct*, 46, 1820-1825.

APPENDIX A: Puanga Reflective Journal Sample

CHALLENGE 1:   I reflect on practice – what do I need to change?

This challenge is about confidently using the teachable moment *"to confidently make the transition from comfort zone to uncertainty zone" (Shulman, 2004).*

Reflective Questions

1. Describe a strategy you have discussed with a colleague that helped your learners
2. What do I need to change in my teaching to ensure successful student learning?
3. How do I manage teaching demands? What strategies do I use?

CHALLENGE 2:   I know my cultural lens - how does it influence my students' progress?

Tutors who are aware of a bi-cultural approach to delivery, linking Western models and perspectives to Te Ao Māori, are able to engage confidently to motivate learners to achieve their goals. A tutor's willingness to acknowledge gaps in their own knowledge and preparedness to learn from their students is a powerful tool.

Reflective Questions:

1. How do I know that I am linking Western models and perspectives to Te Ao Māori
2. What actions do I take to create and provide a bi-cultural approach in my teaching?
3. What do I think about the concept of learning from my learners?

CHALLENGE 3:   What do I have to share? I have something to share

Tutors need to work with the learner, to value and utilise what they bring to the classroom – truly learner centred delivery. Māori and Pasifika learners particularly need to know who you are. They are engaged through connections and affiliations.

Reflections:

1. Who am I as a teacher? Where am I from? How can/do I share this information with my learners?
2. How do I value what learners bring to the classroom? (and how do I show this?)

CHALLENGE 4:   What can I learn? I do have something to learn

The ability or flexibility of a tutor to alter their way of working can be the difference between a learner staying or leaving. This requires continual learning by the tutor which can

be scary if the tutor is used to being in control in the classroom. This requirement also poses challenges for managers of tutor teams.

Reflections:

1. Why do I teach?
2. How do I learn through my teaching?
3. What is my understanding of the difference between student-centred and teacher-led practices?

CHALLENGE 5:   How do I regard my student?

Positive regard requires tutors to look at what will inspire learners to achieve the next level (step) in their learning.

Reflections:

1. How do I inspire learners to aspire to lifelong learning?
2. What strategies do I use to acknowledge learners in their skill gain?

How do I create opportunities for learners to become autonomous learners?

APPENDIX B: Community of Practice Guidelines

Process	Tasks and activities
Introductory Workshop	• Explain purpose and process of a CoP • Explain concept of Puanga Te Matapae Oranga and application of the Puanga Reflective Journal • Introduce concept and practice of peer observation and review
CoP Meetings	• Six-weekly team meetings • Two-hour duration • Meeting dates and times organised by Heads of Department • Each team member manages meeting process and group dynamics on a rotational basis • Tutors come prepared to share one reflection (or more) from their Puanga Journal with the group • Tutors may share the feedback and outcomes of their peer observation • All members have opportunity to share, ask questions, discuss their practice
Time between CoP Meetings	• Tutors reflect on- and in-practice using their Puanga Journal as a prompt/guide • Trialling teaching & learning strategies • Self-directed learning/researching in teaching & learning • professional development events
Evaluation	• Formative and summative (if CoP has an end date) • Mediums include: online questionnaire, face to face, phone, email • Informal feedback during CoP meetings

APPENDIX C: Tutor Reflections

Challenge One: **I reflect on my practice – what do I need to change?**

"I ask the students how I could incorporate other content into the curriculum. They have expressed an interest in a particular topic."

"Natural Learning: A teachable moment to me is something significant which happens when learners achieve. It could be something as simple as gaining praise from peers that gives them confidence to keep going. For me when these moments happen, I need to allow more time for discussion."

*"For the reluctant students I need to work one on one to help and motivate them.
I have started getting student input into their topics of interest; this has helped motivate students."*

"Reflection seems to be the fundamental approach to personal and professional growth. Every day you reflect on your students, your lessons, and yourself. Managing teaching demands through the process of planning and teaching the teachable moment I have gained a deeper awareness and understanding of my role in the tutoring profession."

Challenge Two: **I know my cultural lens – how is it influencing my students' progress?**

"I enjoy learning about my students' values and beliefs. I encourage them to share these as I learn from this too."

"Inclusiveness: I like linking both worlds as I believe extending my knowledge in both realms will assist the learners to also be current and up with the continuously changing environments. I am aware of my cultural lens which helps me to help them extend themselves."

"I treat all my learners as individuals giving them as much autonomy as possible; the dynamic nature of the YG course ensures my planning is very flexible. I make myself approachable so that students are not afraid to voice opinions, ask questions or ask for help. I am not afraid to say that I do not know the answer to questions asked.

"By asking students to share their Maori perspective on the topics we study. Using correct pronunciation of Maori words/phrases and asking my students for clarification when unclear."

"Placing learners into a single learning style 'box' ignores the reality of the whole person. Therefore, through Te Ao Kori learning from your learners shows appreciation and acknowledgement of student's prior knowledge and affirms individual effort."

"Promoting inclusive, ethical and professional relationships is by developing real, authentic connections. For these connections to manifest into one that involves trust, respect and accepts an atmosphere of welcome, I acknowledge each of my students as they enter the classroom, spend time getting to know them and each other by using humour, and real-life stories. I make it a priority to pronounce their names correctly as this demonstrates respect to one-and allows the learners to know from the beginning that I am willing to authentically know who they are. From this first impression I believe it sets up an atmosphere of inclusive practice."

Challenge Three: What do I have to share? I have something to share

"Connectedness: I will always ask people where they are from and see if I can link them or connect them to a certain area or people. Open discussion is always a good way to open communication lines and also having a genuine intent to help others."

"If I want my students to be honest with me, I need to be honest with them. Every morning I great the students then we discuss what we got up to the night before. I have also discussed hardships I have experienced in my life prompting students to discuss problems they have encountered; this has led to some heart-breaking stories. This allows me to know my learners and them to know me. Knowing my students allows me to value and utilise their knowledge."

"I am a very open and honest person who likes to share my life experiences."

Challenge Four: What can I learn? I do have something to learn

"I enjoy relationship building and do this easily. I am a hands-on person who takes care not to offend others when I am tutoring keeping learners and my peers mana intact at all times. Being respectful is important to me and so is working with a holistic approach to learning for learners."

"Because I enjoy sharing my knowledge and life experiences with others and hope that I can have a positive effect on others."

"Kaha: I myself regard learning as a pivotal part of my existence and to be able to share new skills, knowledge and be part of motivating others is exciting. It is a journey you undertake together in which you make a commitment to participate in activities or opportunities that may be provided. The success for me has been seeing the learner gain in knowledge and skills that have given them more opportunities than what they had prior. Employment opportunities, further training or a new set of skills will keep our minds strong and healthy."

"Having knowledge of my student's history, life situations and background has humbled me. Knowing what these young people have gone through has caused me to respect and admire my students. These students show a level of resilience that would break most people. I have built a level of trust that allows students to share their lives with me. Honesty has been key in understanding academically and holistically how my students learn and what motivates them. I often include students in the planning process showing them that their student voice is valid."

"By sharing my own experiences and asking them to share theirs. Encouraging them to talk/work through any previous negative experiences regarding learning."

APPENDIX D: CoP Meeting Structure Guideline

"An effective approach to community activity involves creating a predictable rhythm that sets an expectation around how and when to participate in the community."
(Sanchez-Cardona et al., 2012)

The following guidelines suggest several ways in which a CoP meeting can be structured to promote value-for-time for group members. These strategies are a collation of feedback received from the project participants and the CoP literature.

Ways to Structure your CoP Meetings

1. Commence each meeting with an informal check-in for members to talk about 'what's on top'; for example, what has been happening in their teaching since the last meeting.
2. A dedicated segment of the meeting for sharing reflection (supported by the Reflective Journal).
3. Peer-led teaching sessions in which each member presents a topic or leads a discussion of interest to all members. A useful strategy is to determine topics in advance and include them within the CoP action plan and agenda:
   a. Introduce the topic
   b. Facilitate a mock teaching session, providing the other members with a session plan and examples of teaching and learning approaches they can use in their own teaching context
   c. Invite group members to participate in the discussion
   d. Monitor and reply to comments and questions
   e. Identify and post resources relevant to and supporting the session
4. Presentations on existing practices, followed by discussions on how to improve them.
5. Identification of problems for the group to discuss and solve together.
6. Members share an aspect of their practice that they would like to receive feedback on from the other group members.
7. Have a 'big word' that denotes the theme of the meeting. Members come prepared to discuss their perspective on and/or experience with the theme.
8. Schedule 'special meetings' with an invited speaker talking on a topic relevant to the group's purpose.
9. Each member takes a turn to pose a question to the group for discussion.
10. Group members work together on tasks or activities that impact on their teaching practice; for example, moderation, session planning.